



Information for Social Change

ISSN 1364-694X



Information for Social Change Number 25

Summer 2007

Special Issue on Libraries and Information in Conflict Situations

Special Issue Editors:
Martyn Lowe and Toni Samek



Information for Social Change is an activist organisation that examines issues of censorship, freedom and ethics amongst library and information workers. It is committed to promoting alternatives to the dominant paradigms of library and information work and publishes its own journal, *Information for Social Change* (freely available online at <http://www.libr.org/isc>). Information for Social Change is an Organisation in Liaison with the Chartered Institute of Library and Information Professionals (CILIP).

Information for Social Change Number 25 Summer 2007

Special Issue on Libraries and Information Workers in Conflict Situations

CONTENTS	Page No.
Editorial - Libraries and Information Workers in Conflict Situations (Martyn Lowe and Toni Samek)	1.
It is Time to Tread our Own Path - It is Our Time (Sara Plaza Moreno)	6.
When Memory Turns into Ashes ... Memoricide During the XX Century (Edgardo Civallero)	7.
Truth and Youth: the First Victims of War - Military Mis-information and the Responsibility of Libraries (Anna Kirkpatrick)	23.
Information's Role in Emerging Democratic Societies: the Case of Indonesia (Zola V. Maddison)	26.
Where Social Justice Meets Librarianship - Truth Commissions as Information Spaces for Work and Activism in International Librarianship (Sergio Chaparro-Univazo)	33.
A Commitment to Human Rights - Let's Honor the Qualities Required of a Librarian Dedicated to Human Rights (Katharine J. Phenix and Kathleen de la Peña McCook)	39.
Women Living Under Muslim Laws (WLUWL) (Sarah Masters)	49.
Cultural Property in Times of Conflict (Richard Saltzburg)	53.
Civil Resistance and People Power: a Web Based Bibliography (Martyn Lowe)	60.
Disseminating Truth to Power - Human Rights, Information and the Internet as Court of Last/Only Resort (Clay Collins)	61.
A Library for Peace: the Commonweal Collection (Ellie Clement and Alison Cullingford)	79.

ISC JOURNAL SEPTEMBER 2007

Editorial Libraries and Information Workers in Conflict Situations

This summer 2007 issue of the Information for Social Change (ISC) journal takes a look at the provision of information and various related aspects of library and information work within *conflict situations*. In our definition of conflict situations, we include not just wars or civil wars, but also societies in which there is major social strife. We have tried not just to include articles which address the provision of libraries within conflict situations, but also to place such work within its wider social and political contexts. In putting this journal issue together, we considered both the provision of libraries within conflict situations and those individuals and groups who work within the very culture of such library or information projects. Accordingly, we thought it important to highlight some people who provide information and help to others, who are caught up within conflict situations. We also tried to cover aspects of the work of peace libraries and coverage of various relevant resources to aid those who are working within or upon various conflict situations throughout the world. We hope that the contributions provided help to shed light on some of the many issues which confront those who labour within conflict situations on a daily basis.

Please note that this issue of ISC was developed in the spirit of our umbrella group, Information for Social Change, which has a special interest in receiving, publishing, documenting, and giving memory to information about conflicts on which very little information has been recorded to date. Our group is particularly interested in explorations of how to protect information providers in terms of their human rights (e.g., privacy; confidentiality; freedom of opinion and expression; freedom of thought, conscience and religion; peaceful assembly and association; and, protection from torture or cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment), as expressed in the *Universal Declaration of Human Rights* (1948).

The international contents of this libraries and information workers in conflict situations theme issue include the following contributions: an opening poem titled "It is our time to tread our own path" by Sara Plaza Moreno, which powerfully sets the tone for the subsequent writings starting with a feature globally themed article on "memoricide" in the twentieth century by Edgardo Civallero; a probing treatment of military recruitment and misinformation

and the responsibility of libraries to low-income youth by Anna Kirkpatrick; an Indonesian case look at information's role in emergent democracies by Zola V. Maddison; a discussion of where social justice and librarianship meet in the context of international librarianship, activism, and the tough subject of truth commissions by Sergio Chaparro; an annotated list honoring American librarians who have dedicated themselves to human rights and the cause of social justice by Katharine J. Phenix and Kathleen de la Peña McCook; an introduction to Women Living Under Muslim Laws (WLUML), an international solidarity network that provides information, support and a collective space for women whose lives are shaped, conditioned or governed by laws and customs said to derive from Islam by Sara Masters; a discussion of issues, activities, and preventive measures focused on cultural property in times of conflict by Richard Saltzburg; introduction to the Civil Resistance & People Power web based annotated bibliography, which covers all aspects of the various nonviolent struggles for independence, social justice, and human rights that have taken place throughout the world since the end of WWII and contributed by this issue's co-editor Martyn Lowe; a second feature article, this one on truth, power, human rights information, and the Internet as court of last/only resort by Clay Collins; and, finally with our closing thoughts to peace, Ellie Clement's important storytelling of David Hoggett and the Commonweal Collection, a precious, unique, independent, specialist library devoted to non-violent social change.

We wish you well in your reading, especially as in the time that it has taken to put this issue together (summer 2006 to summer 2007) we have started to see a growing realisation that all new, and future wars, will be a consequence of the weather changers and resulting from climate change. We realize that climate change is a direct result of carbon emissions. We believe that we can all make individual contributions to cutting carbon emission, thus helping to stop the causes of future wars. We, in the library community, can do our bit to counter and reduce global warming (e.g., by doing an energy audit in each of our libraries, by encouraging the use of energy efficient equipment, by implementing recycling programs within libraries, by ensuring that our libraries carry local information about energy efficiency and recycling facilities, and by being selective about where we travel for work and why).

Peace,
Martyn Lowe
Toni Samek
-- August 26, 2007

Contributors

Sergio Chaparro-Univazo was born in Peru and is currently Assistant Professor at the Graduate School of Library and Information Science, Simmons College in Boston, USA. He holds a BA in Library Science and Hispanic Linguistics and Literature from Pontificia Universidad Catolica del Peru, as well as an MLS and a PhD from Rutgers University, USA. He took his MLS degree with the support of a Fulbright Scholarship. Sergio's teaching and research focus on information policy, international librarianship, digital information services, and reference. Contact: sergio.chaparro@simmons.edu

Edgardo Civallero (born in Buenos Aires, 1973) graduated in LIS in the National University of Córdoba, Argentina (2004). He currently works as an independent researcher, teacher, and writer. His activities involve indigenous and rural libraries, oral tradition, anarchist and progressive librarianship, open access, human and aboriginal rights, and alternative points of view within LIS. "Memoricide" - memory *and* library destruction - has been one of his interests after working inside indigenous communities where memory was vanishing and was partially recovered by implementing "special libraries". Contact: edgardo_civallero@yahoo.com.ar

Ellie Clement is a trustee of the Commonweal Collection (<http://www.brad.ac.uk/library/services/commonweal/index.php>) and involved in the library collective at the 1in12 Club (<http://www.1in12.com>) both in Bradford, Yorkshire, UK. For a day job, she works at the University of Bradford as their Engineering, Design and Technology Librarian. She is a chartered member of CILIP, a Fellow of the Higher Education Academy, and a mum. Contact: e.l.clement@bradford.ac.uk

Clay Collins is pursuing an M.A. in library and information studies at the University of Wisconsin—Madison, USA. He is a former research fellow at the University of Minnesota, USA Human Rights Center and a 2004 recipient of the Upper Midwest Human Rights Fellowship. Clay is currently interested in human rights informatics, informational politics, and transnational advocacy networks. He may be reached at claycollins@gmail.com

Alison Cullingford is Special Collections Librarian at the University of Bradford, West Yorkshire, England. She cares for over 100 archive and rare book collections on peace, politics, history, archaeology, religions, and more. See <http://www.bradford.ac.uk/library/special> for further details. Contact: a.cullingford@bradford.ac.uk

Kathleen de la Peña McCook is Distinguished University Professor at the University of South Florida, USA. She was President of the Association for Library and Information Science Education in 1988 and was the 2002 Latino Librarian of the Year (Trejo Award). She received the Beta Phi Mu Award for distinguished service to education for librarianship in 2003 and is author of *Introduction to Public Librarianship* (2004); *A Place at the Table*:

Information for Social Change Issue 25

Participating in Community Building (2000); and, *Ethnic Diversity in Library and Information Science* (2000). She serves on the editorial board of *Progressive Librarian* and is active in her Union, the United Faculty of Florida. Contact: kmccook@tampabay.rr.com

Anna Kirkpatrick lives in Nelson, B.C, Canada, where she works as a shelver for the public library. She is involved in movements for food security and peace and is interested in the role that libraries can play in promoting social change. Contact: akrkptr2002@yahoo.com

Zola V. Maddison received an MLIS and certificate in International Development, Management & Policy from the University of Washington USA in 2005. She is interested in libraries as a tool for sustainable social development and has collaborated on library projects in South Africa and Guatemala. She currently works for [WebJunction](#), an online resource that strives to enable vibrant, sustainable libraries for every community. Contact: zmaddison@gmail.com

Sara Masters worked for six years (until February 2007) as the Information and Communications Coordinator of the international coordination office of Women Living Under Muslim Laws (WLUML), an international feminist solidarity network. With many years experience of working with transnational networks and gender, Sarah is now coordinating the Women's Network of IANSA, the International Action Network on Small Arms. A long-time activist, she is also a member of Women in Black a international feminist antimilitarist network and a member of The Maypole Fund, a non-profit women's organisation granting funds to other women's initiatives around the world. Contact: sarahm@gn.apc.org

Sara Plaza Moreno (Madrid, 1972) graduated from Autonomous University with a degree as English Teacher for Children (Spain, 2006) and in Spanish Teacher for foreign people from The International Languages School "International House" of Madrid (Spain, 2004). At present she works as independent editor and writer in Córdoba, Argentina. An indefatigable traveler, she is also a tireless campaigner for reading and writing rights. As a lover of books and stories, she has discovered the most wonderful ones inside people's minds and has developed a good sense of listening to those who sit in front of her. Sara is a woman who finds her home wherever she goes, thanks to her timid smile and her respectful curiosity. Contact: mowfle2s@yahoo.es

Katharine Phenix lives in Boulder, Colorado is the Adult Services Librarian at the Rangeview Library District. Katharine wants to be known as the first person to put a bookmobile online in 1986. She has been Chair and member of the Committee on the Status of Women in Librarianship (COSWL) for the American Library Association, and co-author of several supplements of *On Account of Sex*. She is currently focusing her research on human rights and librarians and the historical and necessary relationship between the two.

Information for Social Change Issue 25

Contact: kjphenix@yahoo.com

Richard Saltzburg was born in Paris, France and grew up in Berlin Germany and attended Berlin American High School. This sort of set the tone for his life, as he ended up living and working in Germany for many years after University graduation. Richard attended The University of Maryland, overseas division and graduated in Heidelberg, Germany and began working for the U.S. Army Education centers as a language Instructor. He is now pursuing a second career in library Science through The University of South Florida and will graduate in spring 2008. Contact: ricsalt@uflib.ufl.edu

It is Time to Tread our Own Path It is Our Time

Sara Plaza Moreno

It is said that skinned knees and tears from bumps last a few moments, but the negative effects of sheltering last a life-time.

The sooner we learn this fact, the better we will deal with the problems that have been preventing us from achieving our goals: meeting the one we are with, the one we want to be.

Only by moving, can we go further. It does not matter whether we decide to walk or to run; to read or to write; to listen or to view; to say or to do; to dream or to imagine.

Books, like steps, spring into life when they find the ears, the eyes, the mouth and the heart that listen to, look at, speak of, and beat inside them.

For our feet to take flight off the ground, it is important to let books be free, to connect their sounds and silences to our lights and shadows, and to allow our minds to be their wings.

When books are bound and gagged, we lose our footing. When we lose footing, we lose our way. We forget where we have been and where the others come from. Neither are we sure where we are, nor where we go.

If we miss our history, our present is clouded. If we cannot recognize ourselves in our differences, we will be denying our most precious treasure: human diversity.

If we cannot make sense of what is around us, how are we supposed to be able to take a step towards the future? Maybe *books* have the answer. Still we have much to learn from their pages.

There is no doubt at all that our past is our wisdom. Why is it so difficult for us to understand that our future might be clearer if we *read* our present?

When Memory Turns into Ashes ... Memoricide During the XX Century

Edgardo Civallero

Part 1. Ash flakes

"Black snow fell over Sarajevo,
darkening the midday sky with ashes
from the million and a half books burning
in what was once the National library".

Phil Cousineau
"Memoricide". From *Night Train*, 2004.

Sunday, August 25th, 1992. During the whole night, the gunners of the Serbian ultra nationalistic leader Radovan Karadžić, placed in the hills surrounding Sarajevo, aimed their grenades, in a totally intentional way, at the National and University Library of Bosnia and Herzegovina, which included the funds of the National Archives. The fire they started incinerated the entire building until the basement, and, with it, every contained document disappeared.

Converted in ash flakes, around 700 manuscripts and incunabula vanished, together with more than 700 titles of Bosnian periodicals (some of them kept since the XIX century) and a unique collection of *Bosniaca*. Catalogs, this useful tool which allows for knowing the titles included in the library's shelves, were also burnt. Just 10 % of all documents escaped destruction. The blackened remains of the rest, of an incalculable cultural and historic value, floated over the city during the following days (Lorkovic 1992).

Three months before, on May 17th, the incendiary grenades had been directed against the *Orijentalni Institut* (Oriental Institute), also in Sarajevo. Destruction was total. Lost was one of the biggest European collections of Islamic manuscripts, including ten thousands of documents of the Ottoman period and more than 5.200 manuscripts written in Arabic, Persian, Turkish, Hebrew and *Alhamijado* (or *Adzamijski*), Bosnian language written using Arabic script.

These two cases were not the only ones. More than 195 libraries were attacked in Bosnian territory, including the Herzegovina Archives, the Library of the Roman Catholic Archbishop of Mostar, and the one of the Monastery of Zitomislic (Lorkovic 1993, 1995). The attacked targets were not military. They were clearly civilian objectives, destroyed as a part of an "ethnic

cleansing" campaign launched by the Serbian army during the Yugoslav (Bosnian) war (1992-1996). War does not imply just the seizure of goods, people and territory: it also needs to delete the memory of the adversary, the reasons supporting their identity and pushing them to resist, to fight, to love... In this sense, the destruction of libraries, museums and archives is not just a war objective: it is a destruction strategy.

After the brutal attack to the National Library in Sarajevo, the Croatian doctor and historian Mirko D. Grmek coined the term *memoricide*, defining the willful destruction of the memory and the cultural treasures of the "others", the adversaries, the (un)known ones (Blazina 1992).

Part 2. Memories

"We know that the loss of our memory mortgages the future. Those who cannot learn from their past are condemned to accept their future without the possibility of imagining it".

Eduardo Galeano
Uruguayan writer.

Narratives, documents, archives - memory is shared culture, an arena for confrontation of different points of view, and a social frame which orientates and strengthens the individual perspectives, as remarked by Italian sociologist Paolo Montesperelli in his "Sociology of memory".

Without memory, nothing can work. In a Voltaire's classic tale, famous philosophers Descartes and Locke passionately argue about the importance of memory. Looking for a solution for this controversy, the Muses – daughters of Mnemosyne, the goddess of memory - take part and, as an experiment, they cancel all forms of memory for a few days. Humankind, as can be supposed, plunges into an impressive chaos. People forget everything, from their most elementary notions to their basic inhibitions. But they especially lose their reasons for living and their future projects, evidently based in their history and their past experiences.

To destroy memory means to dispossess an individual or a group of their main tool for giving sense to their present. Because human beings need to extract, from their past, the necessary answers for understanding their current state and acting in the building of their future.

The imposition of collective amnesias has been fulfilled, throughout history, through the elimination of written documents kept in libraries and archives. These institutions have been, since time's dawn, *the main managers of human memory*. But it must be remembered that this intangible heritage – source of identity, warranty of cultural diversity - is just a little part of all the information kept by the different cultures all around the planet's surface. The

principal store of these stories and memories is the very human mind. Written things are, like Socrates pointed out, just a pale reflect of the main ensemble of the knowledge of human beings. And it must be remembered that *this* memory – deeply neglected by libraries and archives - is also attacked, deleted and destroyed by means of cultural pressures, acculturation, ethnic massive executions, language banning, imposition of foreign traits, murdering of *living books*, and discrimination.

In one way or another, the attackers, the winners or the dominant ones try to eliminate the identity of the defeated, the minority, the dominated ones. When the forces of the Red Khmer took the power in Kampuchea (1976-1979), they assumed a policy of systematic destruction of all the previous "corrupt" culture. A result of such a decision was the destruction of the National Library in Phnom Penh, whose collection was scattered in the street and publicly burnt. It is estimated that just a 20 % of the existing documents escaped incineration (including the famous manuscripts written on palm leaves).

Anyway, these survivors probably suffered intense damages later due to the inappropriate conditions of conservation, handling, and storage.

From Chinese Qin dynasty's policies to the destruction of the Alexandrian library, from Mayan manuscripts eliminated by Spanish bishop Diego de Landa to disappeared African sub-Saharan classical texts, history is sadly plagued with these kind of actions. It could be believed that in the XX century, time of evolution and development, would not witness such barbarisms.

Nothing further from reality.

Part 3. Minority heritage

"The defeated are not totally dominated if they kept the tragic memory of their struggle".

Juan Goytisolo
Spanish writer. *El País* (Spanish newspaper),
14.04.2002.

During the dawn of August 11th, 1998, Taliban troops destroyed the library of the Foundation *Nasser Khosrow*. With its 55,000 volumes, it was considered by Afghans themselves one of the most valuable and beautiful collections of their nation and their culture. It lodged 10-centuries-old Arabic manuscripts, texts in English and *Pashtu*, and an impressive Afghan heritage written in Persian. It possessed unique documents, like the letters that Hassan-i-Sabah, the leader of *fida'iyin* sect (best known as *hashishin*, from were the word "assassins" is derived) wrote to his followers, the seals of the first Aga Khan or the innumerable calligraphic and illuminated marvels of the Timurid period (1370-1506). But maybe the most appreciated treasure was one of

the six remaining copies of the *Shahnama* (*Book or Epic of the Kings*), by Persian poet Firdusi Tusi (935-1020); this one was dated in XII century.

When *mujaidins* entered in Kabul in 1992, the library moved to the city of Pol-e-Khomri. In 1998, 15,000 Talibans entered there, executed Afghans in mass, and attacked with bazookas the building where the library was lodged. As happened in Sarajevo years before, the flames turn all the bibliographic, documental, and historic treasures into shapeless spoils. An immense national, cultural heritage was consumed as a result of a totally irrational action.

Latif Pedram, the director of the library, attributed the attack to an open campaign of annihilation of Persian language and identity, a persecuted culture since Islam arrived to Central Asia. *Pashtu* – whose Talibans consider themselves direct descendants - have a traditional elimination policy of everything related to Persia. Since Muslims arrived in Afghanistan, Persian culture looked for refuge in books and literature, giving shelter to their thoughts and memories on paper and parchment.

In 1943, the library *Mefitze Haskole*, in the Jewish *ghetto* of Vilna (Lithuania) was totally destroyed. Known as the “Jerusalem of *ghettos*” because of its active cultural and intellectual life, its library possessed an impressive collection, as well as archives and a museum, and it was the meeting point of the whole community. Between 1941 and 1943, the whole *ghetto* population was exterminated, through *SS Aktion* campaigns or through massive deportations to concentration camps. All the documents and materials of the library had the same fate as their users.

On April 14th, 2002, during an “anti-terrorist” operation, Israel army dynamited part of the Cultural Center *Khalil Sakatini*, in Ramallah (Palestine). This center had a magnificent library and there was placed the editorial of the journal *Al-Karmel*, one of the most famous and open publications of Arab world. Its director, Palestinian poet Mahmud Darwish (whose house was sacked during the same operation) edited the journal in Lebanon until Beirut was under siege; then he moved to Cyprus, and finally, looking for a little bit of peace in his homeland, he settled in Ramallah after Oslo Accords (1993). There, in Ramallah, other libraries were destroyed during 2002, including the ones placed at the French and Greek Cultural Centers, the Health, Development, Information and Policy Institute, the Ma’an Development Center, the Union of Palestinian Medical Relief Committees, the Al-Bireh municipality, the Bureau of Statistics and the Ministries of Agriculture, Civil Affairs, Culture, Economy and Trade, Education, Finance, Health, Industry, and Transport. (Twiss 2003). This destruction was a part of a campaign of systematic erasing of cultural instruments and organs representing minority or non-dominant peoples. A similar case happened in northern Sri Lanka, cradle and home of the rich Tamil culture. On May 5th, 1989, around 200 policemen of the official Sinhalese majority entered in the commercial area of the city of Jaffna and burnt the Public Library. With its 95.000 volumes, it

was the second biggest Asian collection. It had invaluable Tamil manuscripts, including ancient books written on palm leaves.

By this way, majorities try to impose on minorities, to force their pride, to eliminate their memories, to dominate their reality. Attackers try to break the attacked ones' will, to delete their reasons for resist and defend themselves. The winners try to sweep away the defeated ones' future, to compel them to resign, to force them to lose their identity, to be assimilated.

And sometimes the answer of these peoples to these actions takes the same form, so violent and vindictive. On April 5th, 2004, the library of the *United Talmud Torah Elementary School*, in the suburb of St. Laurent, Montreal, Canada, was destroyed by an incendiary bomb. A message stuck in the building's front linked the attack with the murder of Muslim radical Ahmed Yassin (March 2004) by Israeli militias in Gazah. Out of 10,000 volumes, just 25 books were saved.

Part 4. Losses and recoveries

"Everyone has the right freely to participate in the cultural life of the community, to enjoy the arts and to share in scientific advancement and its benefits".

Universal Declaration of Human Rights. Art. 27.1

Between April 10th and 14th, 2003, and under the indifferent eyes of western occupation forces (mainly from USA), the Archaeological Museum and the National Library of Iraq, in Baghdad, were sacked. The latter, together with the National Archives and the Koranic Library, were set on fire until being reduced to a heap of smoky wastes. The institutions were meticulously spoiled by professional thieves before being willfully incinerated with white phosphorus grenades. British journalist Robert Fisk prevented the incident (without any concern by invading authorities) and witnessed the huge blaze, giving a detailed account in a moving article published in "The Independent"¹.

The National Library lodged Arabic treasures, such as the original manuscripts of Averroes (1126-1198) and of the Persian mathematician and astronomer Omar Khayyam (1048-1131), the first Arabic translation of Aristotle's work and the testimonies of Iraqi life under Ottoman rulers. It preserved Sufi poems, Persian literature, ancient maps, and hundreds of novels. One million books disappeared besides of the millennial clay tablets stolen from the Museum, the million documents lost in the Archive, the 700 manuscripts which were destroyed and the 1.500 which just "vanished".

¹ The Independent. 15.04.2003.

It was not Iraqi religious fanaticism. The greatest international experts on Islamic culture declared that national identity and tradition of Arab peoples stand over their beliefs. Even so, if a religious reason was the origin of such a disaster... how to explain the burning of the Koranic Library?

To break Iraqi morals by destroying their higher symbols of traditional identity? Nobody knows. But an important detail was underlined by international observers: the Archives of the Oil Ministry in Baghdad did not suffer even a little damage, strongly guarded by western soldiers. It is necessary to remember that 13 years before, during the invasion of Iraqi troops to Kuwait, all libraries and information centers were sacked and burnt, or, as in the case of the National Scientific and Technological Information Centre, directly moved to Baghdad (Salem 1991).

However, not everything is lost.

Between a 30 % and a 35 % of Iraq National Library's collections were saved. There were several causes for this miracle: fate (some collections were eventually placed in other buildings, such as the 250,000 volumes lodged in the Al-Hak Mosque); greed (Saddam Hussein appropriated thousands of manuscripts for his private collection) or even generosity: foreseeing the sack, already suffered in 1991, a good number of Iraqi citizens hid in their houses the greater bibliographic treasures.

In Europe, something similar happened. Since it opened its doors to public, in 1950, the Oriental Institute in Sarajevo had allowed the use of its collections under totally open policies. Researchers, documentation centers and libraries had access or exchanged these materials, so a great part of the funds were photocopied or microfilmed and kept in foreign centers. Now, using the system employed by libraries in northern Italy after II World War, Bosnian librarians have started to look for these copies. The answer came quickly: the National Libraries of Macedonia and Slovenia gave the first step, and later, Universities in Harvard, Den Haag and Michigan, and the Spanish NGO "Paz Ahora" (Peace Now) started to facilitate more material for helping in the recovery of the lost heritage.

It was not the first time that international cooperation helped to the recovery of destroyed libraries and its documental goods. Tibet rescued most of its cultural heritage through a program of the USA Library of Congress. During Cultural Revolution leaded by Mao Zedong, all Chinese territory stood the campaign against the *Si Jiū*, the "Four Olds" (Culture, Customs, Habits and Ideas). Starting 1967, such a campaign destroyed every cultural trait understood as traditional and old (stone carvings, art, books, aristocratic architecture) and, in consequence, different of the new mentality supported by communist regime (Ting 1983). The minority and millennial Tibetan culture suffered a tremendous loss, for a high percentage of its cultural heritage was burnt in public acts (Neterowicz 1989, pp.61-62). Fortunately, a good number of the most valuable manuscripts were taken out of the

territory before Chinese invasion to Tibet, by those who followed the Dalai Lama in his Indian exile. Considering that Buddhist Scriptures (called *Cho* in Tibetan and *Dharma* in Sanskrit) are the most important basis for the religion, it is understandable that, during this "exodus", whole libraries were moved. The support of USA Library of Congress allowed that, during the 1960's and 1970's, most of these texts were re-printed. But maybe the most famous case of international cooperation and recovery is the one of Leuven's Library.

During the summer of 1914, in the first days of First World War, the German army invaded neutral Belgian territory. Leuven (Lovaina), Flemish city famous for being the site of one of the most ancient European universities, was declared "open city" and, without presenting any resistance, it was occupied without incidents. A week later, on August 25th (exactly 78 years before the destruction of National Library in Sarajevo), several German soldiers were killed. As a reprisal, more than 200 citizens were summarily executed, and the library of the *Katholieke Universiteit* (Catholic University) was sprayed with inflammable liquids and condemned to flames, which burnt for days. The losses included more than 230,000 books, a famous collection of 900 manuscripts, and more than 800 incunabula printed before 1500.

Such an action provoked indignation and repulse all over the world. Immediately, it started the organization of an international fund (*Lovaina Book Fund*, in 1915) for allowing the restoration of the valuable library. The reconstruction labors started after the end of the war. As a clause of the Versailles Treaty, Germany was compelled to pay 10 millions francs destined to buy books, and the most important German libraries were forced to contribute with duplicated copies of their most valuable treasures, as an indemnification for the damages inflicted to the Flemish university.

In May 1940, Germans invaded Belgium again. And they repeated – even if not in such an open way - the vandal act against the restored library. There 900,000 volumes, 800 manuscripts, all the incunabula, and around 200 engravings of ancient masters were burnt once more (Vanderheijden 1946).

As happened 25 years before, the library was rebuilt again thanks to the international collaboration and support.

Part 5. The phantom of war: numbers for horror

"When they have burned books, they will end in burning human beings".

Heinrich Heine
From *Almansor* (1821).

The Belgian example was just one more of those happening during the two biggest – and most terrible - wars of human history: the World Wars. Even if

the conflict scenarios were extended, in a way or another, throughout the whole world, the main actions were concentrated in European territory. Through intentional attacks against bibliographic repositories or as a consequence of bombings, the damages produced on libraries, archives and bibliographic funds were highly significant.

Maybe the WW II (1939-1945) produced the most terrible damages to human cultural heritage. The German and allied air raids provoked the loss of 20 municipal – and several public- libraries in Italian territory. More than 2 millions printed texts and 39,000 manuscripts disappeared. The destruction included the Public and the National Libraries in Torino (December 1942) and the *Biblioteca Palatina* in Parma (Näther 1990, p.12).

In France, German attacks destroyed 42,000 volumes in Beauvais (June 1940), 23,000 manuscripts in Chartres, 110,000 texts in the *Bibliothèque Municipale* in Douai, the whole library of the *Société de Géographie Commerciale* in Le Havre, a collection of manuscripts in Metz (1944), and the *Bibliothèque Nationale et Universitaire* in Strasbourg, with 300,000 volumes, in September 1944 (Kühlmann 1992, pp.222-247).

In the United Kingdom, the German bombs (1940-1941) reached libraries like the public one in Coventry (100,000 books) and several ones in Bristol, Liverpool, and London (Kelly 1977, p.328). In Russia, the damages produced just in public libraries reached the number of 100 millions books.

In Belgrad (April 1941), German projectiles hit the Serbian National Library; during the fire disappeared 1,300 manuscripts written in Cyrillic alphabet (XII-XVIII centuries), as well as original works of Serbian authors, incunabula, ancient documents, and books printed between 1832 and 1941.

The allied bombs provoked the destruction of countless libraries and collections in Japan, especially in Tokyo between 1944 and 1945 (Borsa 1984). German libraries suffered terrible losses during the attacks in their territory by Russian and allied forces. Millions of books were lost, though a good number of the most valuable documents were saved because they were deposited in foreigner countries. Anyway, a third of the whole German existences were eliminated.

The *Staatsbibliothek* in Berlin lost 2 millions books; the University Library of the same city, 20,000 volumes. Serious damages were suffered by the *Stadtsbibliothek*, the one placed inside the *Reichstag* (this building being completely destroyed), the *Deutsche Heeresbücherei* (German Army Library), and a number of specialized collections. In Bonn, the University Library lost a 25 % of its texts. Bremen *Staatsbibliothek* lost 150,000 books, including rare and precious works, volumes with ancient engravings, 2,000 separatats, and a complete periodical collection. In September 1944, the *Hessische Landesbibliothek* in Darmstadt was destroyed during a bombing, losing 760,000 books (including 2,217 incunabula and 4,500 manuscripts). The losses of the *Stadt- und Landesbibliothek* in Dortmund were of about a

quarter million of volumes, including warrants and a historic collection of maps.

In Dresden, the *Sächsische Landesbibliothek* was destroyed by bombs between February and March 1945. Around 300,000 books disappeared. The *Stadtsbibliothek* of that city lost its reference collection and 200,000 volumes, and the library of the *Verein für Erdkunde* (Geographic Society), around 12,000 documents. The *Stadt- und Universitätsbibliothek* lost 550,000 volumes, 440,000 thesis and 750,000 warrants. In Hamburg, the *Staat- und Universitätsbibliothek* was burnt during attacks in 1943 and 1944, losing more than 600.000 works, the reference collection and the catalogs. In the same days, the *Stadtsbibliothek* in Hannover lost 125,000 books. Libraries in Karlsruhe, Kassel, Glessen, Graifswald and Essen suffered terrible losses as well. The *Stadtbibliothek* of Nuremberg lost around 100,000 volumes and a part of their catalogs in January 1945. The *Bayerische Staatsbibliothek* in Munich was reached four times by bombs between 1943 and 1945, losing half a million books (including thesis and a part of the *Bavarica* collection). In the same city, the University Library lost a third of its collection (around 350,000 volumes); the *Stadtbibliothek*, around 385,000 and the Benedictine Library, around 120,000 books. The University Library of Münster was reached during different attacks since October 1943, losing 360,000 texts (almost two thirds of its collection). The *Württembergische Landesbibliothek* in Stuttgart lost 580,000 books during a bombing in September 1944. Also there, the Academy of Music was totally destroyed and the Technology University Library lost 50,000 out of its 118,000 documents. The collection of 270,000 manuscripts and incunabula kept by the *Thüringische Landesbücherei* in Gotha was confiscated and moved to the URSS by Russians during 1946.

During the siege of Budapest (1944-1945), every little library and an important part of the big ones were damaged. The ones belonging to the Parliament and the Academy of Sciences were touched, and the one placed in the Polytechnic Institute was totally destroyed (Réthi 1967; Kiss, 1972 p.13). In Romania, something similar happened during the same period: 300,000 volumes disappeared from public libraries. The Polytechnic Institute Library in Jassy lost 15,000 books and 4,000 volumes of periodicals. Intentional fires were usual actions. The University Library in Napoli (Naples) was burnt by German troops in 1943, losing 200,000 texts. The same army set on fire the *Bibliothèque de l'Assemblée Nationale* (Library of the National Assembly) in Paris just a year later (destroying 40,000 documents) and the provincial library of Zeeland (Netherlands) in 1940, eliminating 160,000 ancient texts (Tellegen 1953, p.3). The "Germanizing" policies adopted by the German army produced the confiscation and movement to Germany of thousands of volumes stolen from the occupied territories. Local libraries were compelled to replace these lost books with German works. Such a case happened in the French territory of Alsace-Lorraine (1940-1943). After the liberation, the national troops of resistance destroyed the German collections.

These "Germanizing" policies were strong and hard even inside Germany, especially with those texts concerning Jewish people. After the uprising of the National-Socialist (Nazi) Party to power, "black lists" with prohibited authors were prepared for German public libraries, including 10 % of the titles of their collections. This was the first step of a long process which ended in the sadly famous "book burnings", the most important one carried out during May 10th, 1933. A much longer list (around 5,500 titles) was prepared in 1935 (Jütte 1987).

The policies developed for Polish Jews was clearly harder. German occupation forces created the *Brenn-Kommandos* or "Burning Squads" (1939-1945), meant to destroy synagogues and Jewish books. By the action of these squads, the Great Talmudic Library of the Jewish Theological Seminar of Lublin was set on fire. The rest of this library (around 24,000 books) was later sent to Germany together with hundreds of thousands of other Hebrew texts taken from public and private collections. A great part was destroyed during the bombing on Berlin; the rest was burnt during public acts, or turn into paper pulp (Borin 1993).

After the Munich Conference (1938), ex-Czechoslovakia lost a great part of its territory: the Sudets (Sudetenland). Soon, every Czech book – on Geography, Biography, History and national authors - were confiscated from the libraries in this region. Most of them were burnt, and the collections were destroyed or carried to Germany. After the occupation of the rest of the country by the German troops (1939), the National and University Library of Prague lost 25,000 volumes, most of them art books. The collections of the Natural Sciences Faculty were dispersed and destroyed, including the catalog. A great number of other libraries stood severe losses, e.g. the *Slavata* Bible, or the seven codexes from the ancient library of Jan Jodejovsky. It was estimated that the total loss, including incunabula and manuscripts, was around two millions documents (Zivny 1946).

In Poland (1939-1945) such damage also took place. After invasion, German forces started a violent policy of destruction, aimed at Polish libraries, archives and museums. In Poznan, the Raczynski Library and the one at the Sciences Society were destroyed, and the Cathedral Library –with a unique incunabula collection- was burnt. In October 1944, the Warsaw National Library was totally destroyed, losing 700.000 documents (almost all the ancient texts, the map and music collections and the old printed works). The Central Military Library (including 350,000 books on Poland's history) was burnt; this collection also included the Rapperswill Library (60,000 volumes on Polish immigrants during XIX century) and the Krasinski Library, both deposited there for their safeguard. The day after the German evacuation from Polish territory (January 1945), the main collection of the Warsaw Public Library was incinerated. Many other books were moved to Germany, and they were just partially recovered after the end of the conflict. It was estimated that 1.5 out of 2.5 millions books were lost (Bilinska 1946; Biblioteka 1958; National Library of Warsaw 1974).

Russian occupation forces developed similar campaigns of national identity erasing. From 1940, list of prohibited books were published in the Baltic States under Russian power. Texts on history, politics and national authors, especially those written in the national languages (Latvian, Lithuanian, and Estonian) were forbidden, taken out from libraries and bookstores and publicly burnt (Misiunas and Taagepera 1983, p.36).

During the Chinese-Japanese War (1937-1947), Chinese territory suffered the destruction of a great number of collections of valuable information (Pelissier 1971, pp.143-146). The Tsing Hua University Library in Beijing lost more than 200,000 volumes, besides its catalog; the one at the Nan-kai University, in T'ien-Chin, was totally destroyed during July 1937: more than 224.000 books disappeared. Libraries at Ta Hsia and Juang Hua Universities (both in Shanghai) were totally incinerated by Japanese bombs; such a destiny was shared by the libraries of He Pei University (in Fao-Ling) and the Hu-nan University Library.

After 1939, a 10 % of the collections of the Nanking University – along with its catalog- were moved to Japan. It is supposed that the collections of the Royal Asiatic Society and the Shanghai University Library followed the same destiny: the latter lost a 27 % of its western collections and a 40 % of its Chinese documents.

Part 6. Destroying power, saving power

“(...) Damage to memory is worst than physical destruction, because human beings, through cultural monuments, try to turn their mortality into a piece of immortality”.

Carmen Verlichak
Director of the Center for Danubian Studies. *La Nación* (Argentinean newspaper), 12.11.2003

The destruction of memory is not related necessarily with wars or actions developed by majority peoples. Some of them are simple hatred acts. In January 1984, left-wing radical militants destroyed the Library of the *Nederlands-Zuidafrikaanse Vereniging* (Netherlands-South Africa Society) in Amsterdam, throwing the books into the channels. In April 1986, a criminal fire destroyed the third public library of USA, the *Central Library* in Los Angeles. Around 400,000 books were reduced to ashes; the water used for putting out the fire damaged 700,000 texts, and the rest was touched by smoke. Among the lost documents were the most famous leaflet collection from USA Far West, and one of the most important North American collections of cook books.

USA librarian Sylvia Bugbee wrote that the destruction of a people's memory is, without doubt, a form of genocide (vid. note 1). The events of Sarajevo

(destruction and "ethnic cleansing") were just one more example of an inhumane and irrational chain of actions carried out by majorities all over the world (Tutsis vs. Hutus in Rwanda, Sudanese Muslims vs. non-Muslims in Darfur, ethnic fighting in ex-URSS Central Asia countries...). However, this particular fact in ex-Yugoslavian territory provoked such a horror that UNESCO adopted, in 1993, the resolution 4.8, employing some ideas of UN Security Council Resolution 827 (May 25th, 1993, vid. note 2). UNESCO's text "expresses grave concern at the ... destruction of the cultural, historical and religious heritage of the Republic of Bosnia-Herzegovina (including mosques, churches and synagogues, schools and libraries, archives and cultural and educational buildings) under the abhorrent policy of 'ethnic cleansing'". In 2003, after the destruction of the Buddhas of Bamiyan by Talibans in Afghanistan, UNESCO repeated its recommendation with its "Declaration concerning the intentional destruction of cultural heritage".

Human genius – lights and shadows of a changeable spirit - is able to produce the most overwhelming and the most degrading actions. It is either able for creation or for destruction. Memoricide is an example of the last one. But from shadows and darkness, light and new hopes can be created. The crisis and falls, the big defeats and the most miserable situations can turn into generative factors – despite all - of the greatest opportunities. The destruction – intentional or not - of the documental heritage of a nation clearly demonstrates the fragility of the materials chosen for the conservation of the human memory throughout time, and the instability of elements of such an importance for peoples' identity. The history of any society, its best intellectual products, its glories and failures, its heroes and villains, its greatest discoveries, everything is currently kept on the shelves of libraries and archives. The power of this cultural heritage surpasses the highest standards. It is the most valuable treasure owned by humankind: it includes its memories, its desires and the solutions for those problems arisen along the path walked by the previous generations through the past centuries.

All this power, all this valuable experience, is placed right now in the hands of librarians.

Librarianship cannot be understood as a simple technical profession anymore. At present, librarians are *memory managers*; their active role at war times, being aware of the existence of serious disagreements, hatred, violence and many different conflicts (political, ethnic, etc.) is fundamental and strategic for the future preservation of any people's cultural heritage. Upon the decisions and actions of librarians depends identity survival: they have the key to allow children and young people be able to know their roots, their past, the place they come from and the dreams they should pursue and accordingly guide their steps to make them true.

Librarians are not expected to face the violence, bombings, injustices and summary executions featuring war and vandal acts in a direct way. Nor are they to risk their lives and self-security in order to defend and protect the

heritage they manage. To ask for such a thing would be unrealistic. However, if they are conscious of their role in the conservation of their community's memory, they should take preventive actions and implement new policies in order to secure their collections in case of disaster and avoid a possible loss of them. The responsibility assumed for possessing power must be considered at the same level, realizing of its magnitude, the same as the power itself. A great power – the one associated with information – involves a great responsibility – the one of protecting information in order to assure everybody of the possibility of its present and future use.

Perhaps one of the most precautionary measures to achieve the aim of safeguarding from loss or damage any heritage is its reproduction in safe copies and its widespread diffusion. By allowing the biggest bibliographic treasures to spread over a wide area, copying their information in a different way, duplicating them and assuring their open and free access, librarians could guarantee that their community will continue being the owner of their memory. In this way, violence still could damage a valuable masterpiece or a historic document, but such violence will neither be able to kill ideas nor to destroy the knowledge collected as it has been done until now. The community, the people, will own its memory forever.

In order to achieve this goal, librarians should put aside the idea that the library is a museum, a closed place consisting of several shelves in a line, and four walls jealously protecting the books placed on them, from any kind of external contact. The library must be kept alive and should have the opportunity to breathe like a living creature, to grow, expanded and become greater not only in size or number but in importance within the society which gives sense to its existence. Librarians must (re)produce knowledge and spread it, they must help their users to be conscious of the high value of the knowledge they handle, share and enjoy, teaching them to be responsible and to protect their own history and their own culture, in many cases collected in books and documents. Just by changing libraries' policies and librarians' attitudes, trying to set those repositories free from their bonds and succeeding in joining them to their community, the knowledge accumulated inside their walls will belong to everybody. Only then, we will be certain that there will not be any chance to eliminate our cultural heritage, not even by making use of the most terrible acts of violence.

Notes

(1) "Murdering a people is the greatest crime, of course. But killing the memory of a people as preserved in their records is the second worst crime, a form of genocide. As keepers of memory, we have an obligation to speak out against its destruction" [online]. Available from: <http://listserv.muohio.edu/scripts/wa.exe?A2=ind9904d&L=archives&T=0&P=4469> [cited 27 May 2007]

(2) It sets up the International Tribunal of War Crimes, empowered "to prosecute persons violating the laws or customs of war" including but not limited to "seizure of, destruction of or willful damage done to institutions dedicated to religion, charity and education, the arts and sciences, historic monuments and works of art and science" (art. 3, par. (d) of the annex to the Secretary-General's report S/25704).

Quoted Bibliography

American Library Association, 1993. Resolution on the Destruction of Libraries in Croatia, and Bosnia-Herzegovina passed by the ALA Council, January 26, 1993 at the 1993 Midwinter Meeting, Denver, Colorado. In *International Leads*, 7(2), p.2.

Aparac-Gazivoda, T. and Katalenac, D. (eds), 1993. *Wounded Libraries in Croatia*. Zagreb: Croatian Library Association.

Biblioteka Narodowa w Latach 1945-1956, 1958. Warsaw: n.d.

Bilinska, H., 1946. In *Library Journal*, 71, pp.1022-1023, 1034.

Blazina, V., 1996. Mémoricide ou la purification culturelle: la guerre contre les bibliothèques de Croatie et de Bosnie-Herzégovine. In *Documentation et bibliothèques*, 42, pp.149-164 [online]. Available from: <http://www.kakarigi.net/manu/blazina.htm> [cited 27 May 2007].

Blazina, Z., 1992-3. Professor M.D. Grmek visit to Canadian Universities and to AMCA Québec. In *Gaudeamus* (Toronto), n°. 7-8, p.11.

Borin, J., 1993. In *Libraries and Culture*, 28, pp.445-460.

Borsa, I., 1984. Archives in Japan. In *Journal of the Society of Archivists*, 7, pp.287-294.

Buturovic, A., Riedlmayer, A. and Schick, I.C., 1995. Fighting the Destruction of Memory: A Call for an Ingathering of Bosnian Manuscripts [online]. Available from: <http://www.applicom.com/manu/ingather.htm> [cited 27 May 2007].

Encyclopedia of Library and Information Science. New York, 1968-1994, Vol. 2, p.310.

Fighting the destruction of memory [online]. Available from: <http://www.applicom.com/manu/ingather.htm> [cited 27 May 2007].

International Federation of Library Associations, 1994. General Resolution on the Destruction of Libraries in Croatia, and Bosnia-Herzegovina passed by the

IFLA Council, August 27, 1993 at the 59th IFLA Council and General Conference Held in Barcelona. In *IFLA Annual 1993. Proceedings of the 59th Council and General Conference, Barcelona, 1993*. N.d.: Saur, pp.83-84

Jütte, W., 1987. Volksbibliothek im Nationalsozialismus. In *Buch und Bibliothek*, 39, pp.345-348.

Kelly, T., 1977. *History of public libraries in Great Britain (1845-1975)*. London: n.d.

Kiss, J., 1972. *Die ungarischen Bibliotheken*. Budapest: s.d.

Kühlmann, M., 1992. *Histoire des bibliothèques françaises*. Paris: s.d.

Lorkovic, T., 1992. National Library in Sarajevo destroyed. Collections, archives go up in flames. In *American Libraries*, 23(9), pp.736-816.

Lorkovic, T., 1993. Destruction of Libraries in Croatia and Bosnia-Herzegovina. In *International Leads*, 7(2), pp.1-2.

Lorkovic, T., 1995. *Wounded Libraries in Croatia. Book Review*. In *Libraries and Culture*, 30(spring), pp.205-206.

Memory of the World, 1996. *Lost memory – Libraries and archives destroyed in the Twentieth century*. Paris: UNESCO.

Misiunas, R.J. and Taagepera, R., 1983. *The Baltic States: years of dependence (1940-1980)*. London: n.d.

Näther, G., 1990. *Bibliothekswesen in Italien*. München: n.d.

Neterowicz, E.M., 1989. *The tragedy of Tibet*. Washington: n.d.

Pelissier, R., 1971. *Les bibliothèques en Chine pendant la première moitié du XXe siècle*. Paris, n.d.

Réthy, Ch., 1967. In *Bibliothek und Wissenschaft*, 4, pp.173-174.

Salem, S., 1991. In *Information Development*, 7, pp.70-71.

Stubbings, H.U., 1992. *Blitzkrieg and books*. Bloomington: n.d.

Tellegen, B.D.H., 1953. *De Provinciale Bibliotheek van Zeeland*. N.d.

The National Library in Warsaw, 1974. Warsaw, n.d., p.1.

Ting, L.H., 1983. Library services in the People's Republic of China. In *Library Quarterly*, 53, pp.134-160.

Information for Social Change Issue 25

Twiss, T., 2003. *Damage to Palestinian Libraries and Archives during the Spring of 2002*. ALA International Responsibilities Task Force, n.d.

Vanderheijden, J.F., 1946. In *Library Journal*, 71, pp.636-638.

Zivny, L.J., 1946. In *Library Journal*, 71, pp.877-878.

Truth and Youth: the First Victims of War Military Mis-information and the Responsibility of Libraries

Anna Kirkpatrick

In times of war information is often distorted to serve the interests of those in power. For this reason, the value of the library is perhaps most strongly felt in wartime. It is important that there be a way for ordinary people to assess the claims made by the government and the often-compliant mass media. The internet is one source for such information but for in-depth research libraries are unparalleled. When information is restricted or distorted, everyone benefits from access to libraries. However, the need for independent and objective information is greatest for those whose lives are at stake —particularly young people at risk of being recruited. It is no exaggeration to say that for low-income youth, access to accurate information is literally a life-and-death issue.

If information as a whole is distorted in wartime nowhere is this more blatant than in military recruitment campaigns. Military recruiters are notorious for making attractive offers to young people. These include promises of travel, skill development, money for college and financial security. As various groups, including the American Friends Service Committee and Coalition Against Militarism in Our Schools (2005), have pointed out, these promises do not always materialize. The belief that military service will result in money for college motivates many young recruits. But as Ensign (n.d.) notes, "Among recruits who sign up for the Montgomery GI Bill, 65% receive no money for college, and only 15% ever receive a college degree."

One might think that public schools would provide a forum for young people to consider the implications of military service. Unfortunately this is not usually the case. Indeed, young people are particularly vulnerable to military recruitment while at school. This is in part a structural problem. The development of North American public education was heavily influenced by military models in Europe. Some have argued that historically state schools served a military purpose. Even today military values such as unquestioning submission to authority and regimented routine are reflected in school rhetoric (Hern 2003). Schools, through their structure and some of their core principles, reflect a military mentality and send the unspoken message that a military model is normal and right.

But the problem goes further still. Military recruiters have access to North American schools, both indirectly through posters and other materials, and directly through the presence of military personnel on campus. The No Child Left Behind Act gives military recruiters easy access to American high

school students. As Ayers (2006) notes, the Act “mandates that military recruiters have the same access to students as colleges. The bill also requires schools to turn over students’ addresses and home phone numbers to the military unless parents expressly opt out.” Public schools could be providing students with the intellectual tools to access the claims of military recruiters. Educational institutions could help develop students’ resistance by encouraging inquiry and debate. Instead, though, schools have become closely integrated with military programs and now play a essential role in recruitment campaigns. For this reason schools are not a reliable source of objective information about the military.

Low-income students, lacking information about the options available to them, are easily lured into military service. Once there they can discover that the promises they received were false and that the information they were provided was not accurate. In this context, where schools often implicitly and explicitly support the military, how can students be expected to make an informed choice? Where can youth go for objective information about military service and about the career and educational options available to them?

Libraries could play an important role in supporting the educational and informational needs of potential recruits. As mentioned earlier, a desire for further education motivates many of those who enlist. Alvin Johnson’s book *The Public Library: A People’s University* (1938), makes an argument that is still relevant today. He urges that we “develop the public library into a permanent centre of adult education, informally, a people’s university.” Johnson believes that libraries have much to offer in technical as well as academic subjects. He suggests that libraries play an important role in the development of career-related skills: “I do not know of any quantitative data on the number of persons who have been helped over what might have been grave obstacles to a continuing useful career. But everywhere one encounters instances of men [sic] who owe their positions or promotions to the public library” (Johnson 1938). Low-income youth may have limited educational opportunities. The library, as Johnson suggested almost 70 years ago, could be a centre for advanced education accessible to all.

Those at risk of recruitment have a need for accurate, objective information. The information needs of this group are varied and might include:

- what military service involves
- rights and legal advice
- analysis of promises made by recruiters
- youth and war resisters’ organizations
- employment and education opportunities.

Ideally, libraries could support the needs of low-income youth in three ways: by advancing their education, by helping with the development of career-related skills, and by providing access to relevant information. Before that can happen though, libraries will have to change. In order to effectively support this group, libraries should first publicize the available services in a way that is meaningful to youth. Low-income youth are not typical library

users and those who do venture in should be treated with sensitivity (by considering for example, what media are most accessible, preferred languages and the approachability of library staff). Military recruitment campaigns are supported by lavish budgets. Libraries cannot possibly compete. But, given their resources, libraries could play a major role in countering military misinformation.

Resources

American Friends Service Committee National Youth and Militarism Program
Do You Know Enough to Enlist? (pamphlet), 2005.

Ayers, William "Heart and Mind: Military Recruitment and the High School Battlefield"

Phi Delta Kappan Ap. 2006 Vol 87 Issue 8 pp594-599.

Coalition Against Militarism in Our Schools *Demilitarizing Schools and Presenting Alternatives* (pamphlet), 2005.

Common Dreams www.commondreams.org.

Ensign, Todd in *The New Yorkers' Guide to Military Recruitment in the Five Boroughs* <http://www.counterrecruitmentguide.org/military.php>.

Hern, Matt *Field Day* New Star Books, 2003.

Johnson, Alvin *The Public Library: The People's University* American Association for Adult Education, 1938.

Information's Role in Emerging Democratic Societies: the Case of Indonesia

Zola V. Maddison

A popular Government, without popular information, or the means of acquiring it, is but a prologue to a farce or a tragedy; or, perhaps, both. -- James Madison

Examining the historic role of information access in an emerging democracy offers an opportunity to qualify the potential value of information in its ability to transition, build, and sustain a democracy. In the case of the Republic of Indonesia, we can also evaluate the impact that electronic distribution of information has had in the country's efforts toward self-determination and development. For library professionals, understanding the obstacles to free access to information in an historic and political context can provide a valuable tool for recognizing where and why communities are not accessing necessary resources and provide insights as to how we might better meet the information needs of developing communities.

A Brief History of Public Information in Indonesia

Indonesia's relationship with information has historically been linked to a ruling political power determining the output of information as a means of maintaining political hegemony. We can trace the first major output of information arriving on the islands through the colonial Dutch newspapers that emerged in the 1850's. Indonesian, Javanese and Chinese language papers soon followed and Dutch colonists were quick to recognize the potential of indigenous language newspapers for spreading nationalist ideologies that conflicted with their own. In response, a series of laws and regulations were created to control the dissemination of information. The most restrictive of these were the *Haatzaai Atrikelen* (Sowing of Hatred Articles) followed by the 1931 Press Act. Both could be used to silence anyone perceived of "disturbing 'public order' or spreading 'hatred' or dissent against the government." (Hill, 1) Publicly endorsed as a necessary social stabilizing mechanism, the legislation would become a model for censorship that would continue to plague the Republic for decades.

After establishing independence in 1945, Indonesia experienced a series of short-lived governments resulting in a brief respite from such tight control of the press. However, the new and popularly exercised freedom quickly came to a close with the installation of Indonesia's first president, Sukarno. Faced with civil unrest, Sukarno declared martial law and, within a year, had carried out over 125 acts of suppression against the press, including interrogations

of journalists, detentions, and newspapers closures. (Basorie, 66) Sukarno's "Guided Democracy" borrowed themes from his colonial predecessors; most notably that the suppression of a free press was necessary to create social stability. Before ceding power to Suharto in 1967, Sukarno signed a revised Press Act into law. Chapter 9, Article 20.1a required that editors obtain an SIT (*Surat Izin Terbit* or Permit to Print) from the Ministry of Information's military security authority any time the state was 'in transition'.

FREE BUT RESPONSIBLE

Suharto's "New Order" was an effort to create a growth-oriented, modern Indonesia through an authoritarian political system. Striving to create a national consensus devoid of any dissent, Suharto implemented the *Paket Lima UU Politik* (Package of Five Political Laws). (Hikam, 6) The laws of the package stressed the need to place all political and social forces under the direct supervisory control of the executive Government. Under the guise of "protecting the rural masses from political manipulation of the competing parties", the strategy limited the operation of dissident political parties forming at the district level by requiring that all interest groups receive government approval of their elected leaders and permit monitoring and surveillance of the groups by the executive Government. (7) Unique to Suharto's legacy was his understanding of how print and broadcast medias could be used to promote his political ideologies. He created a social marketing strategy that required the press to be 'free but responsible'. In practice, the combination of social marketing and *Paket Lima UU Politik* meant that approved articles on agricultural development, family planning and economic prosperity were circulating, while simultaneously suppressing political dissent and social unrest.

To implement his social marketing system, Suharto instated an anti-subversion law, which made the dissemination of works that "arouse hostility, cause splits, conflict, chaos, disturbances, or anxiety" a crime punishable by death. (Committee, 2) Statements critical of the President or Vice President were strictly prohibited. (Article 134, 2) By January 1974, Suharto had dismantled twelve publications and arrested 470 individuals. (Hill, 5) The arrested consisted primarily of activists, journalists, and students, forming an unforeseeable alliance that would play a crucial role in future events.

Suharto's administration continued to find ways control information design and distribution. In 1975, the Indonesian Journalists Association (PWI) became the only officially sanctioned journalist organization. As such, membership became compulsory for practicing journalists and editors were forced to accept the new government regulations. (Basorie, 68) Any remains of a free press were completely dismantled by 1982. Sukarno's 1966 Press Act, which had continued to allow for provisions on the press only during transitional times, was revised to mandate licensing from the Ministry of Information regardless of political climate. (67) The new license, SIUPP

(*Surat Izin Usaha Penerbitan Pers* or Press Publication Enterprise Permit) became one of the most powerful tools in controlling the activities of the press. The distinct difference between the SIT and the SIUPP was that the later was directed at press corporations, rather than individual publications. One journalist explained, "Now they can shut down the parent company and all its subsidiaries, break you financially, and knock you out of play for good... The SIUPP is your blood vein, and once it's cut, its over." (Committee, 11) And unlike the SIT permits that were temporarily revoked, all revocations of SIUPP permits were permanent. Often revocation occurred on the grounds of breaking the "SARA rules". These rules barred journalists from reporting on sensitive topics thought to incur civil unrest. Any coverage of issues surrounding ethnic (*Suku*), religious (*Agama*), racial (*Ras*), or social (*Antar golongan*) tensions were subject to SIUPP revocation. (7) At the same time, foreign reporters were being denied visas to enter the country or extensions on their visas, some were expelled from the country, and others denied access to sensitive areas of the country. (16) Authorities also began censoring articles from incoming internationally recognized publications. (18) Yet despite the severe increase in government scrutiny and interference in the press, the newspaper industry was booming. In 1978 there were approximately 5 million newspapers in circulation. That figure more than doubled to reach 11.7 million by the end of 1990. (Hill, 8) Free speech may have been stifled, but Suharto's social marketing strategy was definitely circulating.

1994

On June 21st, 1994 three leading publications, *Tempo*, *Detik*, and *Editor*, were banned on charges of "spreading hatred toward the government" and tensions between the press, public, and government were gathering steam. (HRW, 1) In the days following the ban, demonstrations comprised of journalists, intellectuals, student activists, and non-governmental organizations broke out throughout Indonesia. According to a Human Rights Watch report, troops wearing black t-shirts with the words *Operasi Bersih* (Cleaning Operation) written across their chests, beat unarmed demonstrators with rattan whips. (8) Seven weeks after the ban, an independent group of journalists formed the Alliance of Independent Journalists (AJI) despite expulsion from PWI and subsequent arrests. (Alatas, 156) Their tenacious reporting and dissemination of information regarding the political situation, backed by student activists, NGOs, and intellectuals, helped to inform the global community about the severe and consistent human rights violations occurring within the Republic. Many of these journalists reported a growing sense of exhaustion and weariness as a result of their continued efforts to protect freedom of speech. It was at precisely this time that the Internet made its way to Indonesia.

The Internet, Economics, and the Fall of Suharto

While Suharto had a firm grasp on the impact of traditional media, he had little understanding of the potential of the Internet. Budiono Darsono, editor of Detik.com, stated, "The regime seemed to be ignorant of the power of the Internet as a global network that allows vast and quick dissemination of information. They saw the Internet more as a bunch of computers..." (Winters, 114) Suharto failed to take into consideration the model of communication the Internet offers. Unlike the one-dimensional mode of communication offered by newspapers and broadcast media, the Internet allowed global information to flow rapidly in both directions without government scrutiny. The early partnership forged between journalists and students was strengthened by this new technology that was suddenly within their reach. Indonesian activists were becoming better informed through email and Internet articles, and at the same time used these tools to inform the international community about their crisis. Information was coming to light regarding the use of the military to kidnap and kill students previously involved in demonstrations, as well as other civilians involved in anti-Regime activities. (Suryadinata, 53) A journalist could easily use the new technology to send a report that would reach thousands of listservs without procurement of permits or fear of punishment. Student activists, using university connections to the Internet, accessed this information to amplify support and organize demonstrations. The walls of the Indonesian parliament were being plastered with photocopied Internet articles *and* being updated almost hourly! (Winters, 117)

Concurrently, international scrutiny of Indonesia was becoming more intense. While Internet reports of human rights violations were on the rise, the value of the Rupiah was plummeting. Six months after the 1997 Asian economic crisis, the Rupiah dropped from Rp2,350 per U.S. dollar to Rp16,500 (Suryadinata, 43). With Suharto's children owning several financial institutions that flagrantly and repeatedly ignored International Monetary Fund (IMF) requirements, the rampant corruption and cronyism throughout Suharto's administration became too hard to ignore. The IMF soon agreed to global demands to remove funding for an irresponsible regime that denied free speech and supported the horrific human rights violations occurring in East Timor, Irian Jaya, and Aceh. All of this meant very bad business for the Republic's business elites; their currency was worth nothing and the global financial sector was increasingly uncomfortable doing business with them. The small elite business class joined the *reformasi* (reform movement) furthering the spread of information on the Internet via their global contacts. (Suryadinata, 52)

On May 21st 1998, Suharto resigned from office, explaining that under the current situation it was "very difficult to perform the tasks of government and [to promote] development of the country anymore". (50) Acting Vice President, B.J. Habibie, was chosen by Suharto to be his successor. Wildly unpopular by the majority of citizens during his year in office, Habibie tried

desperately to distance himself from Suharto's legacy by establishing a 'real democracy' with both free press and free elections. (Djohan, 90) By September of 1999, Habibie created a new Press Act that abandoned all permit requirements and allowed journalists to join the professional organization of their choosing. Article 4 of the Act states, "the national press shall not be subject to censorship, press and broadcast bans, and shall have the right to seek, obtain and disseminate ideas and information." Equally impressive is Article 18, which states "any person who obstructs the press from doing its work to seek, obtain and disseminate information, or acts to censor or ban the press, could be prosecuted and face a maximum two years in prison or pay a fine of up to 500 million Rupiah (US\$50,000)." (Basorie, 70) With these new pieces of legislation in place, Indonesia had finally come into an era of free speech, exemplified by a 300 per cent increase in the numbers of daily and weekly publications. (Gazali, 133) The next step toward becoming a functioning democracy was for Indonesia to hold its first free and open elections. Prior to the June 7th 1999 General Election, only 33 per cent of Indonesians believed that Indonesia was a democracy and by August, that figure had more than doubled to 74 per cent. (539)

Growing Pains

Democracy in the Republic of Indonesia is still very young, and the country is in a difficult state of transition. The legacy of more than a century of political censorship through colonial and authoritarian rule has stunted democracy's growth. In 2000, at least 118 acts of violence and harassment - including physical assault, kidnapping and torture - were perpetrated against the press. Sadly, members of the general public had become responsible for carrying out these heinous acts. (Basorie, 73) This self-censoring behavior, while disappointing, is not unexpected. After so many years of censorship and information manipulated, Indonesians report difficulty evaluating the legitimacy of many information sources now at their disposal both online and in print.

The press needs to take some responsibility for advancing Indonesia's transition. The Philippine Center for Investigative Journalism (PCIJ) found that "some members of the Indonesian media industry also appear to have a problem getting rid of certain bad habits they learned during the Soeharto era... Envelopes containing cash are still handed out at press conferences and other media events - and many reporters continue to take them." (74) PCIJ reports that low salaries are partly to blame for media corruption, but lack of transparency and accountability are also at fault. Opening meetings to public and professional scrutiny may offer a simple mechanism of diminishing media corruption and advancing transparency. Libraries are particularly well-positioned to meet many of these transitional needs. Staff can provide the much-needed information literacy training to address evaluation concerns by the press and public, as well as increase transparency by providing access to government information. Suharto and his predecessors may have been correct in viewing open information as a destabilizing mechanism; however

the extent to which the instability has a negative impact on a society can be mitigated through increased information literacy education and transparency within government and public information agencies.

References

Alatas, Syed Farid. *Democracy and Authoritarianism in Indonesia and Malaysia: The rise of the post-colonial state*. New York: St. Martin's Press, Inc., 1997.

Bakti, Andi Faisal. "Pitfalls of the Past Governments of Indonesia: Good governance from the perspectives of communication and development." *Good Governance and Conflict Resolution in Indonesia: From authoritarian government to civil society*. Ed. Andi Faisal Bakti. Jakarta: IAIN Jakarta Press, 2000. 37-50.

Basorie, Warief Djajanto. "Free but still in the Dark." *The Right to Know: Access to Information in Southeast Asia*. Ed. Sheila S. Coronel. Quezon City: Philippine Center for Investigative Journalism, 2001. 64-95.

Gazali, Effendi. "The Suharto Regime and Its Fall Through the Eyes of the Local Media." *Gazette: The International Journal for Communication Studies* 64.2 (2002): 121-140.

Hikam, Muhammad A.S., Dr. *Problems of Political Transition in Post New Order Indonesia*. Brussels: European Institute of Asian Studies, 1999.

Hill, David T. *The Press in 'New Order' Indonesia: Entering the 1990's*. Perth: Asia Research Center, Murdoch University, 1991.

Hill, David T. "Communication for a new democracy: Indonesia's first online elections." *The Pacific Review* 16.4 (2003): 525-548.

In the Censor's Shadow: Journalism in Suharto's Indonesia. New York: Committee to Protect Journalists, 1991.

Indonesia: Press closures in Indonesia one year later. New York: Human Rights Watch/Asia, 1995.

Samad, Ramli Abdul. "The Double Edged Sword: A Brief Comparison of Information Technology and Internet Development in Malaysia and some Neighboring Countries." *IFLA Journal* 27 (2001): 314-318.

Sealy, Wendy Unette. "Empowering Development Through E-Governance: Creating Smart Communities in Small Island States." *Intl. Inform. & Libr. Rev.* 35 (2003): 335-358.

See, Ch'ng Kim. "Government Information and Information About Governments in Southeast Asia: A new era? An overview." *INSPEL* 35.2 (2001): 120-136.

Suryadinata, Leo. *Elections and Politics in Indonesia*. Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, 2002.
19

Thahir, H.A. Samad. *Analyzing Indonesian Election 1999*. Jakarta: Indonesian General Election Commission, 2001.

Transition to Democracy. Jakarta: United Nations Development Programme, Indonesia, 1999.

Utami, Ayu. "A letter from a reporter." *Banning 1994*. Ed. Ayu Utami, et al. Jakarta: Alliance of Independent Journalists, 1994. 1-14.

Voionmaa, Kaarlo. "Elections and the Media: A discourse analysis of the 1997 and 1999 elections in Indonesia." *Elections in Indonesia: The New Order and beyond*. Ed. Hans Antlov and Sven Cederroth. London: RoutledgeCurzon, 2004. 138-161.

Winters, Jeffrey A. "The Political Impact of New Information Sources and Technologies in Indonesia." *Gazette: The International Journal for Communication Studies* 64.2 (2002): 109-119.

Yulianto, Otto Adi. "The Media Watch Movement: Case Studies on the LKM, KIPPAS and MWCC." *Indonesia's Post-Soeharto Democracy Movement*. Ed. Stanely Adi Prasetyo, et al. Jakarta: DEMOS, 2003. 383-404.

Where Social Justice Meets Librarianship Truth Commissions as Information Spaces for Work and Activism in International Librarianship

Sergio Chaparro-Univazo

The fight for social justice is a task related to most disciplines of knowledge. The library and information (LIS) arena is not and should not be foreign to this quest. This brief article attempts to bring attention to the importance of establishing a relationship between an area of LIS such as *international librarianship* (IL) and the current concerns in the information world about social justice through the provision and dissemination of adequate information for the citizen.

International librarianship is a discipline that involves, among other goals, the quest to examine and analyze the values and orientations of international information (Lor 2005) (Lor and Britz, 2005). Modern approaches to IL pay attention to the role of information flow and access in the international arena and the challenges that they are facing (Kesselman and Weintraub 2004) (Lor and Britz 2005). Those challenges require responses that relate to ethical pillars such as human rights, social justice, and the examination of the common good (Lor and Britz 2005, p. 65). Some of those values are the matter of this article, especially those that relate to social responsibility and human rights because we consider them as part of the next paradigm of IL; one that complements the problem-solving paradigm within international librarianship. This paradigm suggests that IL acts as a useful area within LIS education because it enables the practitioner/professional to examine other societies and library practices in order to gather knowledge about potential solutions for library and information problems. We suggest here that aside from this pragmatic approach, social justice as an additional goal would enable IL and librarianship in general to gain more power and visibility among other disciplines and it would help establish a closer and more fruitful connection with law, public policy, information economy, and ethics.

The relation between librarianship and human rights has been discussed in the literature in several different ways. Addressing the presence of human rights in librarianship, for example, the unfortunate role of censorship and the illusion of neutrality on the part of the librarian (Phenix and De la Pena McCook 2005), (Byrne 2002), (Darch and Underwood 2005) (Maret 2005). Phenix and De la Pena MacCook (2005) provide a very interesting approach to the connection between librarianship and human rights: "As we carry on with our duties as public service librarians, we should keep in mind our history of human rights advocacy, and note the work we do today as a continuation of the commitment to the contributions of our

programs, collections, and services toward keeping an open society, a public space where democracy lives" (Phenix and De la Pena McCook 2005, p. 24).

Interesting and useful for any further discussion is the recognition of the value and role for human rights advocacy that librarianship is cementing. Here we attempt to expand this link between human rights and librarianship to the extreme by suggesting that an area of librarianship such as IL is perfectly positioned to look at human rights from multiple perspectives of theory and practice. In addition, Samek (2005) has emphasized the fact that "we must recognize that the days of drawing a line between library-issues and so called non-library issues are past (Samek 2005, p. 19)". If we add to these concepts the fact that there is nothing more political than organizing and disseminating information, a factor that is not necessarily well understood (and perceived) in the LIS curriculum, we must understand then the enormous opportunity that IL and its interaction with human rights provide: an opportunity to produce and educate a culture of activism within librarianship's international culture.

Let's remember that there is nothing more political than organizing information. This idea underlies the work of several entities of transitional justice which have been involved in the arduous, difficult, and risky job of building information structures to support historic tragedies in the effort to preserve the memory of them for future justice. The example of transitional justice and its relation to LIS is relevant because it offers a wide array of possibilities for LIS to apply techniques, methods, information technologies, and information structures to build and promote social justice, and therefore to improve the development of nations and societies. We must however remember that other information compounds such as repositories and archives have been working on this matter for a long time.

If development is the ultimate goal, then why not improve one seminal aspect of the development of a nation called social justice? Development is an illusion without justice, and human rights fully integrated as an intrinsic part of the social justice equation. This kind of rethinking is mandatory in the necessary evaluation of library work at present. The rethinking of library tasks and goals is a work in progress through the 21st century and uses activism as one of its main tools (Samek 2006). One step in this process is to look at LIS education and what it actually instructs and conveys in order to redesign some of its core parameters. Social justice should certainly be included among the new parameters. If we are able to suggest an *information society*, we have to acknowledge that this new sphere of information is not fair and balanced for all; its imperfections are highly visible. Mechanisms of control and provision for balance need to be implemented and international librarianship, given its interest in the full and broad international picture, can provide those mechanisms for control and provision.

Let's assess for a second the "electronic environment", "digital world", "global information infrastructure", "wired planet" or any name we want to give it. Two elements of this "new world of information" seem to have paramount importance for the connection between librarianship and human rights: The first one is a fundamental precept of librarianship called *access*.

Access to information is recognized as a human right. Therefore, from a general perspective access on itself is a human right entity. The second one is another huge component and fundamental precept of librarianship named *intellectual freedom*. Its study and analysis are part of the LIS curricula in many LIS schools [but for the most part threaded through the curriculum rather than offered in stand alone courses], and its treatment touches upon other disciplines of knowledge such as law and information policy. Provision and dissemination of human rights' information are based on one premise: the information needs to be accessed in a timely and efficient manner. This factor requires fast, effective, and powerful dissemination of information. Without speedy access of relevant human rights information the process of promoting social justice becomes slow and late. Therefore access and intellectual freedom should remain as necessary elements for any discussion of human rights and librarianship.

The discussion of IL and its definition (Lor 2005) calls attention for the need to position IL within the boundaries of LIS. So many times, the question of why IL is a field of study arises. Why not finally fully support the legitimization of IL through the fight for human rights? Human rights are also the pillars of the information society (Hurley 2003) because of the intrinsic importance of freedom of information and intellectual property in the 21st century information society. It is necessary, however, to become more emphatic about the need to educate information workers on the importance of the understanding of human rights within the sphere of librarianship and international information. Social accountability is for example a factor on the corporate agenda; why not translate the same idea of social accountability to the information arena? IL may help to address current and future issues of freedom of information and intellectual property because the discipline offers the best possible space to integrate critical dialogue about the complexities of international and transborder information flow. Going even further, IL can become an active educational force in the advocacy for social accountability in the production and use of information worldwide. In the same way, international librarianship has the power to argue for a closer connection with the human rights agenda by calling attention to human rights information issues and situations worldwide, and by establishing close connections to other disciplines like political science, public policy, information economy, and law.

Two spaces and one strategy for activism may help to clarify the role of IL in advocating, promoting, disseminating and protecting human rights from the point of view of information analysis, discussion, and advocacy:

Space 1. Truth Commissions and reports. Truth commissions all around the world have been enacted to promote the concept of transitional justice. From El Salvador to Chile, Peru and Namibia, truth commissions can be understood as exhaustive social justice efforts in the gathering, organization and dissemination of testimonies, memory, and data intended to shed light on human rights violations. Efforts of this kind are actually transformative informational experiences for cultures and nations, for the most part shocking and emotionally painful, but absolutely necessary for social justice. IL can bring on an analysis and evaluation of the methods

involved in the collection and analysis of the data. It is important however to understand that IL can look at the issue from both multidisciplinary and interdisciplinary points of view. Other disciplines already mentioned above can add to the analysis and examination of best practices when dealing with transitional justice too. IL then is very well positioned to address an enormous set of human rights' issues.

Space 2. Cultural Heritage and Preservation. Current attempts to build up electronic repositories of information (visual printed/non printed) challenge the notions of cultural heritage. Cultural heritage international policies, such as those from UNESCO: *World Heritage Convention 1972*², *Declaration of Melbourne 1998*³, *Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage 2006*⁴, help to protect and promote the culture and information values of indigenous groups and populations. In the quest to "digitize", "visually record", and "preserve electronically" issues of respect, cultural memory, and recognition of the value and cultural factors of human groups need to be related to basic human rights. Intellectual property and the fair use of information and communication technologies are aspects that IL is concerned about. This is an arena where one of the most important 21st century information battles will be held. The increasing wave of privatization, commercialization, global market fundamentalism and how they impact copyright practices on the part of corporate information forces and international bodies make necessary to bring on elements of human rights to the discussion in order to protect, preserve, and guarantee the survival of cultural heritage for those that genuinely own it.

Advocacy and Activism for Human Rights knowledge. Another area in which IL can play a role is the advocacy and activism for human rights knowledge. Again, those individuals and groups that work in IL could use their expertise and knowledge to advocate for the dissemination of human rights knowledge through the gathering, organization, and design of information tools and systems that would enable more versatile and efficient access to human rights information. IL could also enable more progressive study of multiculturalism and multilingualism in order to enhance and empower the notion and cultural content of human rights all around the world.

Human rights are then an arena in which the traditional forces and values of librarianship can establish connections, dialogue, and advocacy in the 21st century. The assistance of sub-disciplines of LIS, such as IL, may provide with a new way of addressing human rights values in the information arena, ultimately furthering the goals of an emergent global information justice movement.

² <http://whc.unesco.org/en/conventiontext/>

³ http://www.unesco.org/culture/forum/html_eng/australia.shtml

⁴ http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=16429&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

References

- Birdsall, W. F., McIver, W. J., & Rasmussen, M. 2003. The Internet and the right to communicate. *First Monday*, 8(12).
- Birdsall, W. P. , (2005). Libraries and the communicative citizen in the twenty-first century. *Libri*, 55(2-3), pp.74-83.
- Britz, J. J., & Lor, P. J., 2003. A moral reflection on the information flow from south to north: An African perspective. *Libri*, 53(3), pp.160-73.
- Britz, J., & Lor, P. , 2004. A moral reflection on the digitization of Africa's documentary heritage. *IFLA Journal*, 30(3), pp. 216-23.
- Byrne, A. , 2004. Libraries and democracy: Management implications. *Library Management*, 25(1/2), pp.11-16.
- Byrne, A., 2002. The sounds of silence: Copyright and human rights. *Australian Academic and Research Libraries*, 33(4), pp. 275-83.
- Darch, C., & Underwood, P. G. , 2005. Freedom of information legislation, state compliance and the discourse of knowledge: The South African experience. *International Information and Library Review*, 37(2), pp. 77-86.
- De la Pena McCook, K., 2004. The librarian and human rights: Protecting discourse against repression. *Catholic Library World*, 75(1), pp. 23-28.
- Grosek, E. , 2002. Locating the Texts and Status of International Human Rights Protection Agreements. *Behavioral & Social Sciences Librarian*, 21(1), pp.15-26.
- Kesselman, Martin A. and Irwin Weintraub, eds. *Global Librarianship*. New York: Marcel Dekker, 2004.
- Kuerbis, B., Mueller, M., & Page, C. , 2004. Civil society and the shaping of communication-information policy: Four decades of advocacy. *Information Society*, 20(3), pp.169-185.
- Lor, P. J., & Britz, J. , 2005. Knowledge production from an African perspective: International information flows and intellectual property. *International Information and Library Review*, 37(2), pp. 61-76.
- Maret, S., 2005. "Formats Are a Tool for the Quest for Truth": HURIDOCS Human Rights Materials for Library and Human Rights Workers. *Progressive Librarian*, 26, pp. 33-9.

Information for Social Change Issue 25

Montgomery, B., 1996. Archiving human rights: a paradigm for collection development. *The Journal of Academic Librarianship*, 22, pp. 87-96.

Phenix, K. J., & de la Pena McCook, Kathleen. , 2005. Human rights and librarians. *Reference & User Services Quarterly*, 45(1), pp. 23-26.

Phenix, K., & McCook, K., 2005. Human Rights and Librarians. *Reference & User Services Quarterly*, 45(1), pp. 23-6.

Reiling, D. , 2006. Doing justice with information technology. *Information & Communications Technology Law*, 15 (22), pp.189-200.

Samek, T. (2005). Ethical Reflection on 21st Century Information Work: an address to teachers and librarians. *Progressive Librarian*, 43-61.

Samek, T. (2006). Freedom to Read Week: The Strength of Librarianship in a Fragile World. *Feliciter*, 52(1), 18-19.

Schrader, A., 1999. The 'stretch': from human rights to information rights. *Feliciter*, 45(1), pp. 10-11.

The charter of fundamental rights. (2001). *European Information*, (14), 4-5.

Yannie, M. (2006). Social Accountability International: <http://www.sa-intl.org>. *Journal of Information Ethics*, 15(2), pp. 112.

A Commitment to Human Rights Let's Honor the Qualities Required of a Librarian Dedicated to Human Rights

Katharine J. Phenix
Kathleen de la Peña McCook

Introduction

The two of us have been writing partners for many years. It began with our support for the Equal Rights Amendment in solidarity with the Illinois Women Library Workers in the early 1980s. We marched at the state capitol and we brought original copies of Alice Paul and the National Woman's Party's *Equal Rights* to hunger strikers; we sat in on protests; we developed research papers with data to use in political debate and more recently, we are studying the innate (integrated, essential, core) values of librarianship and their connection to human rights (McCook and Phenix 2007; Phenix and McCook 2005).

We have spent many hours thinking, talking and writing each other about how library workers can make a difference beyond our daily work. What we decided to do as our contribution to this important issue of ISC is to provide a list of some of the librarians in the United States who as political actors in our times provide examples of a commitment to equality, the right to know or social justice. In some cases if the individual has received an award we use that as an indicator to lay down a marker that brings their actions to attention.

Our list changed as we expanded our research into human rights and libraries. Some days we wanted to include the writers and the researchers: Anita Schiller for groundbreaking work on unequal treatment of women in librarianship; Eric Moon for many reasons, but at the very least for his editorial "Silent Subject" on civil rights in 1960; John Berry for his focus on unions, ethics, responsibilities of library workers; Mark Rosensweig for, among many other thoughtful commentaries, his composition of the ALA Resolution Against the Use of Torture as a Violation of Our Basic Values as Librarians (ALA SRRT 2004).

We also note that there are, and have been, many librarians who develop gardens of literacy in weedy neighborhoods; who bring bibliotherapy to wounded populations; who provide access to the world of published ideas where before there was no track or trail. We salute them, but excluded most of them from the list because a hero risks something personal in the passionate work of a higher cause. For now, we offer this rough,

bibliographic map to some of the political actors in U.S. libraries because they are people who have been brave, committed, and daring in their library work and writings.

The Heroes

Note: Citations in parenthesis provide documentation source.

1924. **Agnes Inglis** collected and organized the Labadie Collection of labor and anarchist materials at the University of Michigan (Herrada and Hyry, 1999).

1935. **Lucy Randolph Mason and Hilda Hulbert**, librarians at the Highlander Folk School in Monteagle, Tennessee could not help seeing the connections between libraries, information, and social justice. Hulbert, who was shot in the ankle while walking with striking textile workers, wrote these words to the Southern Field Director of ALA

"Crying for education and information and contact with the great army of workers in the same situation, the southern worker needs books as never before, and this is a great challenge to me" (Loveland 1998).

1937-1939. **Philip Keeney**. Founder of the Progressive Librarians Council, Keeney chartered this group with the purpose

"to support and strengthen the efforts of the Third Activities Committee in bringing more democracy into the structure and functioning of the American Library Association; to promote federal and state aid for libraries by supporting the Thomas-Harrison Bill and strengthening state library agencies; to unite all progressive librarians whose single voices are inaudible into a group which will be heard" (McReynolds 1990/91).

1938-39. **Stanley Kunitz, Forrest Spaulding**. Des Moines, (Iowa) librarian, Spaulding, drafted the Library Bill of Rights in response to concern about freedom to read during a time of national political distress. A revised version was adopted by the American Library Association in 1939. Agricultural Kern County California's county commissioners banned *The Grapes of Wrath* (as did other communities in the U.S.), an action condemned by Kunitz (who was to become Poet Laureate of the U.S.) in his capacity as editor of *Wilson Library Bulletin* (Robbins 1996).

1942-1945. **Clara Estelle Breed**. San Diego Public Library children's librarian, Breed, visited Japanese-American children in internment camps, sent them books and corresponded. Her collection of letters from children is part of the Japanese American National Museum (Japanese American National Museum 2007).

1950. **Ruth W. Brown**, of the Bartlesville, Oklahoma Public library, was fired after 30 years, ostensibly because the library owned *The Nation*, *The New*

Information for Social Change Issue 25

Republic, and *Soviet Russia Today*, but actually because of her work with the Congress of Racial Equality (Robbins 2001).

1957. **Juliette Hampton Morgan** had long been an advocate of civil rights. She allowed a private letter she wrote to be published in *The Tuscaloosa News*, although she had been asked not to publish any more on racism and the need to change "the Southern way of life." A victim of hate mail and obscene phone calls, she resigned from her job as librarian at the Montgomery (Alabama) Public Library and took her own life (Graham 2002; Tolerance.org 2006).

1959. **Emily Wheelock Reed** was asked to remove *A Rabbit's Wedding* from the Alabama state library collection by state senator Big Ed Eddins because of the intermarriage of black and white rabbits. The library budget came under attack when she refused (Graham 2002).

1960s **Patricia Blalock** helped integrate Selma's public library one chair at a time. She convinced her board that integration in Selma was a forgone conclusion, and gradually convinced them, removing chairs and then adding them back gradually, that it could be done peacefully and without violent intervention (Graham 2002).

1964. **E.J. Josey** offered the resolution at the 1964 Conference which prevented American Library Association officers and staff members from attending segregated state chapter meetings (ALA 2007).

1965. **Blanche Collins** faced down community pressure at the Long Beach Public Library when called to ban *The Last Temptation of Christ*. (Blanche Collins interview 1979.)

1966. **Marvin Scilkin**, noted as an activist librarian and publisher of *The U*N*A*B*A*S*H*E*D L*IB*R*A*R*I*A*N* testified in the US Senate to expose price fixing for library books. In 1996 he successfully campaigned to stop Bell Atlantic from charging libraries for other phone company directories (Roy 2002; Samek 2007).

1967. **Gordon McShean** resigned his from his librarian job in Roswell, New Mexico, over censorship involving "hippie" poets (Robbins 1996, p. 140).

1968. **Joan Bodger**. While working for the Missouri State Library wrote, with the permission of her superiors, a letter to the Columbia (Missouri) *Daily Tribune* against police action in the selling of political newspapers near a college campus. She lost her job though a series of actions and the American Library Association stepped in to investigate (Proceedings 1970).

1969. **T. Ellis Hodgin** lost his job as city librarian in Martinsville, Virginia. He was already active in the civil rights movement, but he was fired when he

joined a lawsuit against religious education in his daughter's school. He was also active in civil rights issues (Hodgin 1971).

1960s **Daniel Gore**, at MacMurray College, Abilene, Texas struggled over issues regarding *The Evergreen Review* (Robbins 1996, p. 140).

1969-1970. **John Forsman**. Risked his job as City librarian in Richmond California over a censorship issue. Carolyn Forsman, his wife at the time, still contributes profits from her jewelry at ALA conferences to raise money for the Freedom to Read Foundation (Robbins 1996, p. 140).

1969-1995. **Jackie Eubanks** was an early SRRT Action Council member, much loved librarian of the New York bookfair and tireless supporter of alternative presses. The ALA Alternatives in Publication Task Force of the Social Responsibilities Round Table presents an award in her name (SRRT Jackie Eubanks Memorial Award 2007).

1971-1986. **Barbara Gittings**. New York founder of Daughters of Bilitis, Honorary ALA Lifetime member Barbara Gittings pioneered efforts regarding gay and lesbian librarianship. Other librarians with similar accomplishments are honored with the ALA Stonewall Barbara Gittings Book Award (Barbara Gittings 2007).

1972. **Zoia Horn**, winner of Jackie Eubanks Memorial Award (2002), Downs Intellectual Freedom Award (2002) The "first librarian who spent time in jail for a value of our profession" says Judith Krug of the ALA Office for Intellectual Freedom, Horn refused to testify in the trial of the Harrisburg Seven and was jailed for the duration (Egelko 2002; Horn 1995).

1979. **Jeanne Layton**. She was the library director in Utah's Davis County and she refused to remove Don DeLillo's *American* from the library. The Utah Library Association and the American Library Association raised money and supported her attempt to regain her job (Intellectual freedom and ALA).

1981-1998. Washington Office. published *Less Access to Less Information by and about the U.S. Government*, a selective chronology of efforts to restrict and privatize government information. (American Library Association, Washington Office).

1990-. American Library Association. Taking on Poverty. In 1990 the American Library Association passed a "Policy on Library Services to Poor People." It still has not been fully implemented (Berman 1998).

1991-1992. **Pat Schuman**. Her presidential theme, "The Right to Know: Librarians Make It Happen," continued work chairing the ALA's Advocacy Committee and founding the Library Advocacy NOW! campaign of training and influencing tens of thousands of

librarians and trustees. She was honored with the 2007 Eileen Cooke State and Local Madison Award, for those who, at the state and local levels, have championed, protected, and promoted public access to government information and the public's "right to know" (ALA Honors Schuman 2007).

1996. **Deloris Wilson** won the Downs Intellectual Freedom Award in 2001 because in May, 1996 her school principal in West Monroe (LA) High School asked her to remove four books from the library shelves. When she refused she was ordered to remove all books with sexual content. After pulling 200 books, including several Bibles, she became a plaintiff in an ACLU complaint against Ouachita Parish (ACLU 2001).

1999. **Sanford Berman**, "one of the profession's most valued and significant contributors to the advances made in cataloging classifications in the 20th century" was forced to resign or face demotion by the Hennepin County Library (HCL). Berman believes he is a target because spoke out against HCL cataloging policy and not because of job performance. He is also a recipient of the 1996 Robert B. Downs Intellectual Freedom Award (Berry).

2000. **Song Yongyi**, Catalog and reference librarian at Dickinson College in Carlisle, Pennsylvania, was held in China for six months on charges of spying. He was released on January 28, 2000. Song had gone to China to research the Cultural Revolution. He received the Paul Howard Award for Courage in 2005 (Yongyi Song 2006).

2002. **Ann Sparanese**. When publication of Michael Moore's book, *Stupid White Men: And Other Excuses for the State of the Nation*, was held from distribution after the attacks of September 11, 2001, Sparanese wrote to librarians all over the U.S. and HarperCollins felt compelled to publish on time. It became a best seller (Bolonick 2002).

2002. **Jerilynn Adams Williams**, a library director in Montgomery County, Texas, winner of the 2003 Pen/Newman's Own First Amendment Award for successfully retaining sex education titles on the library shelves in the face of personal attacks by Reverend Bill Craft and others (Pen American Center 2007).

2003-2004. **Chris Gaunt**. Librarian Gaunt describes peace actions including arrest and jail for her protests against the USAPATRIOT Act and the War in Iraq (Gaunt 2004).

2004. **Joan Airoidi**, Pen/Newman Award Winner because on June 8th the FBI visits the Deming branch of the Whatcom County Library System and asks library staff to provide the names of all persons who'd borrowed a copy of Bin Ladin: The Man Who Declared War on America, by Yossef Bodansky. Joan Airoidi, library director, challenged this. She and her library board asserted that libraries have the right to protect the confidentiality of their patrons (Airoidi 2006).

2006. **Peter Chase, George Christian, Janet Nocek, Barbara Bailey.** Actors in the Doe v. Gonzales case, these librarians challenged the constitutionality of the nondisclosure provisions of the National Security Letters issued by the government under the USA Patriot Act in terrorist or other investigations. The four received the Roger Baldwin Medal of Liberty from the American Civil Liberties Union in June 2007 (American Civil Liberties Union, 6.15.2007).

2006. **Michele Reutty** Winner of the 2006 Robert B. Downs Intellectual Freedom Award was the 17-year director of the Hasbrouck Heights, New Jersey, public library was "under fire" in May 2006 by her own library board for following library protocol and refusing to give library circulation records to the police without a subpoena. She resigned from that position in October 2006 (GSLIS 2007).

2007. **Dana Lubow and Rhonda Neugebauer.** Organized taking a Bookmobile to Granma province in Cuba where it will be used by librarians to provide library outreach services to rural areas (Lubow 2007).

2007. (May 14th) Illinois Librarians in "A Day of Unity" several Illinois librarians took down internet connections, or filtered almost everything in their libraries to protest the Illinois House of Representatives internet filtering bill (In Protest 2007).

Conclusion

"It's always one individual that sparks change; history has proven this time and again," Moore said in thanking Sparanese for completely ignoring his plea to keep his publishing squabble hushed. He noted that the day Sparanese sent her letter to the email lists, was an important day in American history, December 1st. On this day in 1955 a black seamstress boarded a bus in Birmingham, Alabama. When she was told to move to the back of the bus, she remained in her seat. She had made her stand by sitting. Her name is Rosa Parks. (Librarian Makes a Difference for Stupid White Men Author Michael Moore 2002).

Librarians make an impact on lives every day. It is time we made, collectively and individually, an impact on policy. We know there are many more librarians world-wide who belong on this list and we encourage that they be written about and honored as examples to us all. Our list is our own idiosyncratic list of librarians in the United States who have been courageous political actors. We share it with you, the reader, so you can develop your own list and soon librarians everywhere will see that all actions are political and all librarian work should be in service of the freedom of information and development of human capabilities.

Sources

"ALA Honors Schuman." *Library Journal* (March 19, 2007).

American Civil Liberties Union, 2001. Ordinary Heroes: Two ACLU clients to receive the 2001 PEN/Newman's Own First Amendment Award. [Online]. Available from: '<http://www.aclu.org/freespeech/gen/11385prs200104230.htm>. [cited 6 March 2007].

American Civil Liberties Union. ACLU to Honor Connecticut Librarians & John Doe During Seattle Conference. [Online] 6.15.2007. Available from: <http://www.aclu.org/about/30137prs20070615.html> [cited 17 June 2007].

Airoldi, J., 2006. Case Study: A Grand Jury Subpoena in the PATRIOT Act Era. *Library Administration & Management* 20 (Winter 2006), pp.26-29.

American Library Association Social Responsibilities Round Table. A Resolution Against the Use of Torture as a Violation of the American Library Association's Basic Values. <http://www.pitt.edu/~ttwiss/irtf/resolutions.torture2.html>

American Library Association, Washington Office. "Less and Less Access" <http://www.ala.org/ala/washoff/woissues/governmentinfo/lessacc.cfm>

American Library Association. Social Responsibilities Round Table. Alternatives In Print Task Force. Available from <http://www.ala.org/ala/srtr/srtr.htm> [Cited 2 June, 2007]

Barbara Gittings, Pioneer Promoting Gay/Lesbian Literature, Dies at 75. *Library Journal.com* 2 February, 2007. Available from <http://www.libraryjournal.com/article/CA6418452.html?rssid=191> [Cited 2 June 2007].

Berman, S., 1998. Foreword. In K.M. Venutrella, ed. *Poor People and Library Services*. Jefferson, N.C.: McFarland, 1998, pp. 1-14.

Berry, John N. "Citing "Deception," Berman Resigns from Hennepin County" *Library Journal* 124 (May 15, 1999): 14.

Blanche Collins Interview. Project of the Virtual Aural/Oral History Archive, California State University Long Beach. Collins was interviewed by Kaye Briegel on August 1, 1979. Available from alticid.nmc.csulb.edu/.../wa/project?ww=560&wh=400&pt=jaws&bi=1&col=c113&ser=a1017 [Cited 12/1/2006]

Bolonik, K. Muzzling Moore. *Salon* (January 7, 2002). Available from: <http://dir.salon.com/story/books/feature/2002/01/07/moore/print.html> [Cited 17 June 2007].

Breed C., 1943. Americans with the wrong ancestors. *The Horn Book* (19), pp. 253-61.

Connecticut librarians drop John Doe gag. 2006, *Newsletter on Intellectual Freedom*. July, 2006

Egelko, B., 2002. FBI snooping has librarians stamping mad. Local woman jailed in '70s in informant flap, *San Francisco Chronicle*, September 16, 2002. Available from: <http://sfgate.com/cgi-bin/article.cgi?f=/c/a/2002/09/16/BALIBRARIAN.TMP&nl=top> [Cited 2 March 2007].

Hodgin appeal rests with U.S. Supreme Court, 1971, *Freedom Read Found. News* 1 (1971) p. 5) as cited in Krug, J. F. 2003.

Intellectual freedom and ALA: An historical overview, date. *Encyclopedia of Library and Information Science*. Available from <http://www.dekker.com.proxy.usf.edu/sdek/abstract~db=enc~content=a713531926>. [Cited 17 June, 2007].

Gaunt, C., 2004. Jailed for Dissent 'In These Times,' *Progressive Librarian* 24 (Winter 2004), pp.

University of Illinois. Graduate School of Library and Information Science, Robert B. Downs Intellectual Freedom Award. Available from: <http://www.lis.uiuc.edu/about/awards/downs-award.html>. [Cited 7 March 2007].

Graham, P.T., (2002) *A Right to Read: Segregation and Civil Rights in Alabama's Public Libraries, 1900-1965*. Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press.

Heim, K. M. and Phenix, K., 1984. *On Account of Sex: An Annotated Bibliography on the Status of Women in Librarianship, 1977-1981*. Chicago: American Library Association.

Herrada, J. and Hyry, T., 2007. Agnes Inglis: Anarchist Librarian'. *Progressive*

Librarian 16 (Fall 1999). Available from: http://libr.org/pl/16_Herrada.html [Cited 17 June, 2007].

Horn, Z. 1995., *Zoia!: Memoir of Zoia Horn, Battler for the People's Right to Know*. (Jefferson) North Carolina: McFarland.

Japanese American National Museum. Clara Breed Collection. http://www.janm.org/collections/online/clara_breed_collection

In Protest, Illinois Libraries Turn Off Internet or Filter Heavily, 2007. Library Journal.com. Available from <http://www.libraryjournal.com/article/CA6442426.html> [Cited 17 June, 2007]

Juliette Hampton Morgan: A white woman who understood, 2006. Tolerance.org, Teaching Tolerance. Available from: <http://www.tolerance.org/teach/>. [Cited 17 June, 2007]

Librarian Makes A Difference for 'Stupid White Men' author Michael Moore' in ALA Cognotes "Wrap up", 2002. Reprinted in the School of Library and Information Science, Indiana University SLIS Student News. Available from http://www.slis.indiana.edu/news/story.php?story_id=443. [Cited July 1, 2007].

Loveland, G.,1998. The Highlander Library: Educating for a People's Democracy. *Virginia Libraries*, 44(1), pp. 12-14.

Lubow, D. and Neubebauer, R.The Granma Bookmobile Project:Update April 2007. 2007.SRRT Newsletter 158/159 pp. 17-18.

McCook, K, de la Peña and Phenix, K. J., 2007. Human Rights And Democracy. In B. Sheldon,K. Haycock, eds. *The Portable MLS*, forthcoming.

McCook, K. de la Peña and Phenix, K. J., 2007. Public Libraries and Human Rights. In W. Miller, and R. Pellen, eds.,*Current Practices in Public Libraries*. London: Haworth.

McReynolds, R., date. The Progressive Librarians Council and Its Founders. *Progressive Librarian* (2) Winter 1990/91, pp. 23-29. Available from http://libr.org/pl/2_McReynolds.html [Cited 17 June, 2007].

Pen American Center. Texas librarian to receive PEN/Newman's Own First Amendment Award. [cited 3 June, 2007].

Phenix, K. and Heim, K.M., 1989. *On Account of Sex: An Annotated Bibliography on the Status of Women in Librarianship, 1982-1986*. Chicago: American Library Association.

Phenix, K., Goetz, L. and Watstein, S.,1987. *On Account of Sex: An Annotated Bibliography on the Status of Women in Librarianship*. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow.

Phenix, K and McCook, K. de la Pena, 2005. Human Rights and Librarians. *Reference and User Services Quarterly*, 45 (1) pp. ????

Proceedings and findings pertaining to a Request for Action submitted by Joan Bodger under the Program of Action in support of the Library Bill of Rights, 1970. *American Libraries* July-August, 694

Information for Social Change Issue 25

Robbins, L. S., 1996. *Censorship and the American Public Library: The American Library Association's response to threats to intellectual freedom: 1939-1969*. Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood.

Robbins, L. S., 2001. *The Dismissal of Miss Ruth Brown: Civil Rights, Censorship, and the American Library*. Norman, OK: University of Oklahoma Press.

Roy, L., & Cherian, A. (Eds.) (2002). *Getting libraries the credit they deserve : A festschrift in honor of Marvin H. Scilken*. Lanham, MD: Scarecrow Press.

Samek, T, 2007.. *Librarianship and Human Rights: A Twenty-first Century Guide*. Oxford: Chandos.

Yongyi Song receives 2005 Paul Howard Award for Courage. *Journal of East Asian Libraries* (June 2006).

=====

1941 **Ona Simaite** was a university librarian in Vilna, Lithuania when the Germans invaded and sent the Jews to the ghetto. Simaite smuggled food and supplies in, and people and materials out using her librarian role to save valuables (Gilbert 2003).

Gilbert, Martin (2003). *The Righteous: the unsung heroes of the Holocaust*. New York: Holt. p. 85.

Women Living Under Muslim Laws (WLUWL)

Sarah Masters

Women Living Under Muslim Laws (WLUML) is an international solidarity network that provides information, support, and a collective space for women whose lives are shaped, conditioned or governed by laws and customs said to derive from Islam. For more than two decades WLUML has linked individual women and organisations and routinely reaches women in over 110 countries, with networkers based in some 40 countries and communities.

WLUML does not identify itself as a 'Muslim women's organisation', and instead recognises that women affected by Muslim laws are not necessarily always Muslims, and that some born into a Muslim community may have chosen a different marker of political or personal identity.

WLUML's open structure has been designed to maximize participation of diverse and autonomous groups and individuals as well as collective decision-making. WLUML does not have formal membership and networkers are a fluid group of individuals and organisations who maintain regular two-way contact with the network.

The International Coordination Office (ICO) is based in London, UK and has primary responsibility for facilitating coordination between networkers. Regional Coordination Offices are in Pakistan (Asia) and Nigeria (Africa and Middle East) and are responsible for coordinating network activities in their respective regions. Although legally and financially autonomous, they are key components of WLUML.

Since its inception, WLUML has recognized the importance of the circulation of information as a means of establishing networking linkages and reaching out to broad audiences. But whereas some years ago there was very little information available about women's lives in Muslim countries and communities, the mushrooming of information and communication technologies (ICTs) and their rapidly expanding reach along with burgeoning interest in relevant research has meant that WLUML is no longer the sole source of information. WLUML has therefore re-focused the collection and circulation of information, including responding to requests for information, to ensure that the needs of the women linked through the network are placed centre stage. All information related activities comply with UK Data Protection legislation and the privacy and confidentiality of networkers and their information is respected.

WLUML is recognized as an important source of information, solidarity and support at an extraordinary range of levels: by a wide variety of individual women; by activist networkers in Muslim countries and communities; by allies in the feminist and progressive human rights movements. In addition, the wider public, academics, legal and health professionals, media, governmental, and intergovernmental agencies all expect WLUML to provide insights and analyses that will strengthen their work, making dynamic information exchanges our lifeblood.

This recognition is based on a number of factors, including WLUML's linkages with women actively engaged in human rights struggles as well as its significant expertise particularly in the area of the links between religion, culture, custom and law, derived from our collective project, the 1992-2001 Women & Law in the Muslim World action-research Programme.

The ICO collects, analyses, and circulates information regarding women's diverse experiences and strategies in Muslim countries and communities, using a variety of methods and media including printed publications (both regular and occasional). Information activities also involve the pro-active documentation and analysis of trends, experiences and strategies with the aim of strengthening local and international struggles.

Networking is used to link women across the network and link women with the wider feminist and human rights movement as well as provide support for local struggles. Horizontal linkages – i.e. putting women in direct contact with each other rather than centralized linkages through the network coordination offices - are emphasized wherever possible.

Solidarity actions, in the shape of international alerts for action, campaigns and support provided in response to specific appeals (e.g. linking women with legal advice and support institutions), recognize that the provision of concrete support and intervention is vital for the promotion of women's human rights.

Solidarity actions typically involve research on legislation and legal matters; contact with specialized support groups, often in more than one country; directing persons to specialized legal assistance and support; and mobilizing appropriate support for the case. Successful solidarity actions also often depend on the rapid mobilization of local networks of activists and on the strength of alliances that WLUML builds with other international networks. Because of the sensitive nature of many of these cases, widespread publicity about a case may not necessarily be the most appropriate response – and might even be detrimental. WLUML therefore carefully studies the circumstances and consults with those requesting solidarity before deciding whether to request public support or to handle the case quietly.

The process of initiating and responding to alerts often requires extensive and time-consuming investigation, follow-up and updates. Launching an alert

involves checking the source and facts and contacting networkers inside and outside the region concerned. Alerts are circulated internally to elicit a collective decision on how best to proceed, and to discuss strategies and possible backlash. After acting on the alerts, the ICO continues to follow-up the cases, provides updates and solicits feedback on the effectiveness of the alert. Successful alert actions depend on the rapid mobilization of local networks of activists and on the strength of alliances that WLUMML builds with other international networks.

WLUMML collects, analyses, and circulates information regarding women's diverse experiences and strategies in Muslim contexts using a variety of media. It translates information into and from French, Arabic and English wherever possible. Networking groups also translate information into numerous other languages.

Translations are also an important means of enabling networkers to access feminist debates from other contexts and continue to be a cornerstone of WLUMML's documentation and dissemination activities, feeding into the sharing of alternative analysis. WLUMML recognizes that women activists linked through the network have limited access to publications on women's activism produced by mainstream publishers in the developed countries.

A unique resource for academics and activists alike, WLUMML compiles information about the lives and struggles of women living in diverse Muslim communities and countries. One of the main objectives of the Dossiers is to provide a forum for the exchange of experience and ideas between women in these communities. The Dossiers explore and synthesize a broad range of analysis, interpretations and strategies of women on issues of feminism, nationalism, internationalism, and religion. Using a wide range of resources (e.g., articles, narratives, press clippings, general information briefs, appeals and information on books and relevant meetings), the Dossiers reveal and share the various ways in which women in Muslim countries and communities are working for greater autonomy.

In order to bring such publications to networkers, as well as to build active linkages with feminists working in other contexts, WLUMML has an active publications programme which produces the following:

- An annual theme based Dossier (English, French and Arabic), an occasional journal which provides information about the lives, struggles and strategies of women in various Muslim communities and countries;
- A quarterly Newsheet on women, laws and society by Shirkat Gah, WLUMML Asia Regional Coordination Office;
- A bi-annual newsletter (English, French and Arabic) to provide networkers with brief, up-to-date information around WLUMML's current areas of concern/work.

Information for Social Change Issue 25

- Occasional Papers - specific studies and materials which, for reasons of length or style, cannot be included in the Dossier series; and,
- Other publications on specific issues of concern such as family laws, women's movements, initiatives and strategies, etc.

The WLUML website is in English, French, and Arabic with selected information in Chinese and Russian, and is updated regularly with news and views, calls for action and publications. The website is used in an interactive way by networkers and is a valuable communication tool. On several occasions networkers have commented on the contents of the website. For example, in January 2002, a group of active networkers reacted within less than 12 hours of our posting information related to a stoning to death case, pointing out a problematic aspect of one of the posted articles. The ICO immediately took their view into account and modified the contents of its website accordingly.

The use of the WLUML website, the Internet and e-mail has not only sped up the process of responding to information requests, but has enabled WLUML to access and circulate more focused information and to build horizontal linkages.

Capacity building is undertaken to strengthen the network's ability to generate, circulate, analyse and use information; to articulate and disseminate alternative points of view through more effective use of communications technology; to facilitate specific training programmes; to develop outreach programmes that can lead to positive social and legal change; and to strengthen international linkages.

This includes collective projects which have included topic-specific initiatives that arise out of the shared needs, interests and analysis of networkers. Collective projects have included training sessions, workshops, research for advocacy, meetings and exchanges around specialised topics. Previous projects include:

- Exchange programme (1988);
- Qur'anic interpretations meetings (1990) and for West African networkers (2002) and Francophone West Africa (2004);
- Women and Law in the Muslim world programme (1991-2001);
- Feminism in the Muslim World Leadership Institutes (1998 and 1999);
- Gender and displacement in Muslim contexts (1999-2002); and,
- Initiative for Strengthening Afghan Family Laws – INSAF (2002 - present).

WLUML International Coordination Office
PO Box 28445, London, N19 5NZ, UK
Website: www.wluml.org

Cultural Property in Times of Conflict

Richard Saltzburg

At the end of WWII, in March 1946, the Allied Military occupation government of Germany established the Offenbach Archival Depot which was tasked with recovering, identifying, and restoring stolen cultural property to its country of origin, including library and manuscript collections, and Judaic related materials (Rothfield 2005). The Depot closed in 1949 and by that time had handled more than 3.2 million items in over thirty-five languages. (Ibid) To this day, there are still questions of "heirless" and "unidentifiable" Nazi loot being housed in American library collections (Ibid).

The massive problems of identification and returning property after WWII made it necessary to create a set of rules to safeguard cultural treasure during wartime. This first set of interventions with international cooperation was created in 1954 in The Hague. There have since been many more conflicts and these have severely tested the initial agreement. In this paper I will look at these recent conflicts and how the international community has responded to them.

Umberto Eco (2003) spoke at the newly opened Bibliotheca Alexandrina in Cairo, Egypt and said:

Libraries, over the centuries, have been the most important way of keeping our collective wisdom. They were and still are a sort of universal brain where we can retrieve what we have forgotten and what we still do not know. If you will allow me to use such a metaphor, a library is the best possible imitation, by human beings, of a divine mind, where the whole universe is viewed and understood at the same time. A person able to store in his or her mind the information provided by a great library would emulate in some way the mind of God. In other words, we have invented libraries because we try to do our best to imitate them (p.1).

The worst enemy of Libraries is the fanaticism of either or both of the warring parties, especially if one of the goals of the conflict is to rid a country of objectionable religious or cultural material or thinking. Another is a lack of vision of individuals or a government. Added to this is the general feeling that Libraries are not a high priority in times of war, despite the 1954 UNESCO convention for the protection of cultural property. The final blow to Libraries occurs during "The fog of war" when niceties are put aside and all hell breaks loose.

A review of the current literature in the field does not paint a pretty picture of what happens to people and cultural heritage in times of war. Furthermore the safeguards in existence do not guarantee protection for either people or books. These agreements are better suited for preparing a country for war and re-building it afterwards. During the actual conflict there seems to be no guarantee that animosities will be kept in check and that libraries, books and monuments will be spared. For example, a CNN driver currently in Lebanon surveying the mass exodus of civilians towards the north remarks, "Should we put CNN on top of the car? Does that make us less of a target, or more of one" (CNN Online).

One of the protections that countries have in the event of war is the 1954 Hague convention which was drafted as a result of the destruction of cultural property in WWII. Basically countries read the rules and sign on and agree to the terms. The agreement covers the totality of a country's cultural heritage. It is worth noting that of the 100 signers listed, Afghanistan and Palestine are absent as of July 16, 2006 while Iraq, Romania and Bosnia and Herzegovina have signed.

Some of the key provisions are that countries can register cultural property such as buildings into an international list of protected items. Buildings and monuments can also be marked with special emblems, such as a blue shield. There are also provisions to prevent the export of property from occupied territory and violators of any of the rules can face penalties.

Despite the Hague convention, destruction of cultural property continued in the 1980's and 90's. The war in Bosnia-Herzegovina broke out in April 1992 because "Bosnian Serbs [who] refused to acknowledge the sovereignty of the multiethnic Republic of Bosnia and Herzegovina, and who wished to create a separate, all Serb republic within the territory of Bosnia and Herzegovina" (Zeco 1996, p. 296).

The Bosnian Serb forces set out to destroy all Islamic cultural institutions in Bosnia-Herzegovina. They succeeded in bringing down the Oriental Institute, which according to the author was "one of the major research centers for the study of the Balkans, [and] represents an irreplaceable loss (Zeco 1996, p. 297).

The National and University library was fondly called "Vijecnica" a pseudo-Moorish structure built during the Austro-Hungarian rule. It had been the home of generations of students and scholars and was a symbol of the city of Sarajevo and attracted tourists from all over the world. This did not save it from regular shelling and sniper fire. Librarian Ms. Prastalo recounts how one night, the library was ransacked and although piles of periodicals were left untouched, her computer, typewriter, phone and drawers were removed. The author remarks that "It was obvious what kind of thieves were "cleansing" the library" (Prastalo 1997, p. 96). Eventually the library was destroyed and its treasures burned. The author laments that "great treasures of human knowledge were gone for good" (Ibid, p. 97).

During this time The National and University library remained open despite an increasingly chaotic situation. While many fled the city, others stayed behind despite the danger and lack of transportation. Library employees were under the "obligatory" work rule which meant that after three days absence, an employee could be dismissed (Prastalo 1997). The library was hit several times by shelling and sniper fire while the employees were in the building, including the author.

It is worth noting that "during these years, the National Library had established international contacts with its peer libraries around the world, playing its full part as a member of IFLA" (Prastalo 1997, p. 99).

The ethnic cleansing carried out by Bosnian Serb forces was also the agenda of the Taliban in Afghanistan in 1992 when they destroyed the Hakim Nasser Khosrow Balkhi Cultural Center and adjoining library in Kabul. According to Library Director Latif Pedram, "It's my impression that they knew what they were doing and that there was a plan" (Loving 2002, p.69). This institution represented everything that the Taliban disdained. It was a truly democratic place open to all regardless of race or religion and also contained a rich collection of Persian artifacts. "Written into the founding charter were strict rules forbidding proselytizing or bringing exterior conflicts into this sanctuary of culture and learning" (Ibid, p.70). The library also admitted both men and women.

According to former Library Director Pedram, the Taliban wished to rid Afghanistan of all Persian roots because they are Pashtun and "they also had a religious argument against Persian based on their definition of Islam" (Loving 2002, p.71).

A different kind of destruction befell Romania's libraries in the form of 45 years of Communism and cold war. A once rich library tradition fell to neglect by uncaring rulers, a stagnant economy, low literary output, censorship, and a general disdain for librarianship.

Angela Popescu-Bradicieni (cited in Anghelescu, 2001), the director of the central state library explains that under communism all professional associations were outlawed in Romania because of the government's paranoia, therefore the Romanian library association ceased to exist. Anghelescu (2001) also reveals that "Romania's presence at IFLA conferences was only sporadic due to spending cuts" (p. 237).

Anghelescu (2001) also says that "the low prestige of the library as an institution stemmed from the fact that "Romania's party and government leaders had not made use of the libraries themselves, their education being limited to a thorough knowledge of the text of Marxism and Leninism" (p. 238). The final blow to Romanian Libraries under communism was that they did not produce revenue so they were not shown favored status.

McMahon and Withers (2003) write of Bucharest that "the national library has become a symbol of the political infighting and personal interests that permeate nearly every aspect of Romanian life." (p. 30). There hasn't been enough money to complete the library and it has variously been earmarked to be administrative offices or the library. The latest decision is that it will be a library. Unfortunately, the 1,124 acre plot over which these disputes take place will never again be the reason Bucharest was once called the "Paris of the East". The 7000 historic buildings which used to be there were bulldozed by Ceausescu.

The continued destruction of cultural treasure worldwide, especially in those countries aforementioned, necessitated a review of the original Hague convention in 1954 and in 1999 a second protocol was adopted. The Second Protocol is better written and clearer and includes a new category of cultural property under Enhanced Protection. "It also establishes an Intergovernmental Committee responsible mainly for supervising the implementation of the Convention and the Second Protocol, and an International Fund for the Protection of Cultural Heritage" (ICBS Homepage).

Another organization which serves to protect cultural property is The Blue Shield which came into existence in 1996 and is the cultural equivalent of the Red Cross. Their work is to protect the world's cultural heritage threatened by wars and natural disasters. This is accomplished by co-coordinating preparations to meet and respond to emergency situations (ICBS Homepage). The organization is also recognized by the Second Protocol to the Hague Convention, and advises the inter-governmental Committee for Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict.

The Blue Shield relies on cooperation internationally and on the local level. Committees are being formed in a number of countries and consist of people of different professions, local and national government, the emergency services and the armed forces. They provide a forum for them to improve emergency preparedness by sharing experiences and exchanging information. They provide a focus for raising national awareness of the threats to cultural heritage. They promote the ratification and implementation by national governments of the Hague Convention (ICBS Homepage).

ICBS is formed by four non-governmental organizations: ICA (ica@ica.org) which is the International Council on Archives, ICOM (<http://icom.museum/>) International Council of Museums, ICOMOS (<http://www.international.icomos.org/>) International Council on Monuments and Sites and IFLA (<http://www.ifla.org/>) International Federation of Library Associations and Institutions (ICBS Homepage).

UNESCO launched its "Memory of the World" project in 1997 as an offshoot of UNESCO's World Heritage Program and is based on the same principles, though it does not have a signed convention. An international advisory committee meets every two years to choose documents of universal

interest and put them on a register, which now contains 47 documents from 26 countries, including China's historical archives, Copernicus' manuscript in which he described his theory that the Earth revolved round the Sun, as well as the manuscripts of the composer Chopin (L'Homme 1999, p.14).

"IFLA (The International Federation of Library Associations and Institutions) is the leading international body representing the interests of library and information services and their users. It is the global voice of the library and information profession" (IFLA Homepage).

The IFLA homepage at <http://www.ifla.org/VI/4/admin/icbs-iraq.htm> has a link listing how they have been helping different countries re-build their information infrastructure. There is help for Iraq and Romania currently listed and what the help consists of and who is doing the donating.

When libraries are damaged and destroyed during war, there are many consequences. Old and rare works are destroyed and can never be replaced. Library buildings and monuments that lend a certain charm to a city or town are lost. Buildings also contain many memories of those who have visited. This oral history, waiting to be written down might never be due to death and hopelessness. Scores of workers in these buildings have no protection from the shelling and continue to work.

It is for this reason countries must take preventive measures. This includes a written disaster plan together with "strong cooperation between the different actors of the response and recovery team (including the Army and the Civil Defense)" (ICBS Homepage). The important work being done by these organizations must continue and they must be supported. I was surprised to learn that many people have never heard of these organizations and would suggest that all libraries request posters from these groups to post in their libraries as a way to inform the public of their existence.

REFERENCES

Anghelescu, H. 2001. Romanian Libraries Recover after the Cold War: The Communist Legacy and the Road Ahead. *Libraries and Culture*. 36(1), p. 233-263.

Eco, U. 2003. Vegetal and mineral memory: the future of books. *Al-Ahram Online*, [internet] 20-26 Nov. Available at: http://www.umbertoeco.com/id-33/Umberto_Eco_Egypt_Bibliotheca_Alexandrina_2003.html/ [accessed 7 July]

ICBS Homepage. 2006. Available at:

<http://www.ifla.org/VI/4/admin/protect.htm/> [accessed 1 July]

IFLA Homepage. 2006. Available at: <http://www.ifla.org/III/index.htm/> [accessed 1 July 2006]

Kniffel, L. 2003. Though devastating, Iraq library losses may be less than feared. *American Libraries*, [Online]. 34(6), p. 40. Available at: <http://web.ebscohost.com> (Academic Search Premier) [accessed 4 July 2006].

L'Homme, C. 1999. Memory of the world. *UNESCO Sources*, [Online]. 117. Available at: <http://web.ebscohost.com> (Academic Search Premier) [accessed 10 July 2006].

Loving, M., 2002. The war on terror: darkest days; from exile in Paris, Afghan librarian Latif Pedram relives the nightmare. *American Libraries*, [Online] May, (33), p. 68-73. Available at: <http://web.ebscohost.com> (Academic Search Premier) [accessed 27 June 2006].

McMahon, T., & Withers, D., 2003. Romania's Library Lingers in Limbo. *American Libraries* [Online] 34(8), p. 30-31. Available at: <http://web.ebscohost.com> (Academic Search Premier) [accessed 27 June 2006].

Perry, C., 2006. Behind the Scenes: The true Cost of War. *CNN Online* [internet]. 22 July, Available at: <http://www.cnn.com/2006/WORLD/meast/07/21/perry.tyre/index.html> [accessed 22 July 2006]

Prastalo, T., 1997. Death of a library. *Logos*, [Online] 8, (2), p. 96-99. Wilson OmniFile: Available at: <http://vnweb.hwwilsonweb.com> [accessed 6 June 2006]

Rothfeld, A., 2005. Returning looted European library collections: an historical analysis of the Offenbach Archival Depot 1945-1948. *RBM* [Online] 6(1), p. 14-24. Available at: <http://vnweb.hwwilsonweb.com/> [accessed 6 June 2006]

UNESCO Calls for Immediate Security of Iraq Libraries. (2003). *American Libraries* [Online] 34(8), p. 30-31. Available at: <http://web.ebscohost.com> (Academic Search Premier) [accessed 27 June 2006].

UNESCO, (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization) 2003-4 [Online]. Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict – 1954. Available at:

http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/ev.php-URL_ID=8450&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html/
[accessed July 4 2006].

Zeco, M., 1996. The National and University Library of Bosnia and Herzegovina during the current war. *Library Quarterly*, 66, (3) p. 294-298.

Civil Resistance and People Power: a Web Based Bibliography

Martyn Lowe

<http://www.civilresistance.info/>

People Power and Protest Since 1945: A Bibliography of Nonviolent Action.
Published by Housmans Bookshop in March 2006. ISBN 0 85283 262 1

A supplement to this work was published in March 2007. For price information, or to order this work contact: Housmans Bookshop. 5 Caledonian Road, Kings Cross, London N1 9DX, UK. See: <http://www.housmans.com>

The aim of this website is to promote understanding of and research on civil resistance - which is another term for *nonviolent struggle*. The website incorporates People Power and Protest since 1945: a bibliography on nonviolent action, compiled by April Carter, Howard Clark and Michael Randle. This is an annotated bibliography which covers all aspects of the various Nonviolent struggles for independence, social justice, and human rights which have taken place throughout the world since the end of WWII. All three of the compilers are both academics and peace movement activists. They have compiled this bibliography so that it might be used by both human rights activists, and those who engaged upon academic studies. It is both a very useful handbook for human rights activist and a bibliographical tool. Buy it ! Read it ! Study it ! & Use it!

Disseminating Truth to Power Human Rights, Information and the Internet as Court of Last/Only Resort

Clay Collins

Within the context of the concept of the internet as court of last resort for victims of human rights violations, this article explores the case of a Guantánamo Bay prisoner to illustrate the notion that, under certain circumstances, the internet may effectively serve as a court of *only* resort. It then expands to consider the power of human rights information on the internet through the introduction of two important human rights information agencies, ventures a taxonomy for classifying human rights bloggers, and discusses needed library and archival work. It discusses the plight of human rights bloggers as well as the human rights of information seekers and providers on the internet. Finally, it concludes with thoughts on information technology, the crises in Darfur, and the future of internet-based human rights advocacy work.

A. The Internet as Court of Last Resort

In a properly functioning court system, someone whose human rights have been violated may turn to a court of first instance, or a trial court.⁵ If the case is heard before a court and the complainant's grievances are still not satisfactorily remedied, she may appeal the trial court's decision and go through an appeals process that may lead to her case being heard before a court of last resort,⁶ such as a constitutional court⁷ or supreme court.⁸ If her complaints are not satisfactorily resolved and she has exhausted all domestically available legal remedies,⁹ she may attempt to have her case

⁵ *Black's Law Dictionary* defines a trial court as "[a] court of original jurisdiction where the evidence is first received and considered." A trial court may also be termed a "court of first instance; instance court; [or] court of instance." BLACK'S LAW DICTIONARY, court (8th ed. 2004).

⁶ It is true, perhaps without exception, that in every state with a developed court system, the probability a randomly sampled case making it to the court of last resort is very slim. A court of last resort is a "court having the authority to handle the final appeal of a case, such as the U.S. Supreme Court." BLACK'S LAW DICTIONARY, court (8th ed. 2004).

⁷ A constitutional court is a "court whose jurisdiction is solely or primarily over claims that legislation (and sometimes executive action) is inconsistent with a nation's constitution." BLACK'S LAW DICTIONARY, court (8th ed. 2004).

⁸ Generally speaking, a supreme court, such as the U.S. Supreme Court, is a court of last resort. *See supra* note 2.

⁹ International human rights courts, such as the Inter-American Court of Human Rights and European Court of Human Rights, generally will not hear cases until all remedies or claims have been exhausted -- i.e. pursued to the full extent -- in the litigant's home country.

admitted to an international court such as the Inter-American Court of Human Rights or European Court of Human Rights. (In states with corrupt, defunct, or functionally non-existent legal systems, or in instances where national courts are unwilling or unable to take a given case, domestic remedies may be exhausted without the case ever being admitted to a court).¹⁰ It should be noted, however, that due to the small number of legitimate international courts and the large number of cases submitted to such courts, the probability that her case will be taken by an international court is extremely and prohibitively low.¹¹

For a person who (1) has exhausted all available domestic remedies and (2) is unable to gain admittance before an international court, one of her few remaining options may be to publish the story online and hope that the international community -- or at least an international audience -- takes note.

B. The Internet as the Court of Only Resort: the Case of Adel Hamad

For persons stripped of their human right to judicial review,¹² the court of public opinion -- accessed via the internet -- may effectively be the court of *only* resort. Consider the case of Adel Hamad, a 48-year-old Sudanese elementary school teacher who has been held in Guantánamo Bay, Cuba, without charge or evidence of crime for five years. It is uncertain whether a United States federal court or any other court of competent jurisdiction¹³ will ever review his case, especially after President Bush signed the Military Commissions Act in October of 2006.¹⁴ Unable to argue his case before a court, Adel's attorneys created an eight-minute YouTube video, entitled "Guantánamo Unclassified,"¹⁵ using a computer and handheld cameras.¹⁶ The video is narrated by one of Hamad's attorneys, William Teesdale, and includes interviews with former employers, supervisors, and friends which were collected during Teesdale's worldwide travels to collect evidence.

¹⁰ Even if their case were to be heard before the European Court of Human Rights, it may take years before it can be heard.

¹¹ In war torn regions, regions with a large number of dysfunctional court systems, and regions rife with human rights abuses, it is simply impossible for an international court to hear all admissible cases. Indeed, practical limitations often mean that human rights courts only hear cases involving the most flagrant and egregious human rights violations.

¹² See Article 9(4) of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, G.A. res. 2200A (XXI), 21 U.N. GAOR Supp. (No. 16) at 52, U.N. Doc. A/6316 (1966), 999 U.N.T.S. 171, *entered into force* Mar. 23, 1976.

¹³ A court of competent jurisdiction is a court "that has the power and authority to do a particular act; one recognized by law as possessing the right to adjudicate a controversy." BLACK'S LAW DICTIONARY, court of competent jurisdiction (8th ed. 2004).

¹⁴ The Military Commissions Act of October, 2006 "attempts to strip the federal courts of jurisdiction to hear Guantánamo detainee habeas cases." Because of the Act, "[Adel's case is] presently stayed pending resolution of this issue." William Teesdale, *Representing Adel: The Case of Guantánamo Detainee 940*, Jurist, at <http://jurist.law.pitt.edu/forumy/2007/01/representing-adel-case-of-Guantánamo.php> (Jan. 12, 2007).

¹⁵ William Teesdale et al., *Guantánamo Unclassified*, YouTube, at <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=D5E3w7ME6Fs> (last modified Jan. 5, 2007).

¹⁶ Andrew K. Wood, *The YouTube Defense: Human Rights go Viral*, SLATE, Mar. 28, 2007, at <http://www.slate.com/id/2162780/>.

Within a month, the video was viewed over 70,000 times and twice as many persons had visited the Project Hamad website,¹⁷ which is “part of a fast-growing public campaign to eviscerate the Military Commissions Act, passed by Congress last year, which denied Hamad his day in court.”¹⁸ As one commentator noted, “[w]hile Hamad may never see the inside of a U.S. court, the public attention to his case may have forced the government’s hand[: j]ust this week, the project told Hamad’s supporters that the Department of Defense has added him to a list of people slated to be released from Guantánamo.”¹⁹ Indeed, as Adel’s attorneys have demonstrated,

YouTube and its ilk mean that today anyone can tell human rights stories . . . [and] if the stories are told with enough brio and skill, the public will pay attention, and the government may be more likely to respond. Critics pooh-pooh the importance of all of this by pointing to the fact that civil rights advocates have traditionally had a friend in the press. But they’re missing the point: YouTube goes where the mainstream media can’t or won’t go. It’s visceral. It’s story *first*, message second. And it gives advocates instant access to an audience in a way that press releases and op-eds never can.²⁰

Another reason why media outlets such as like YouTube are so powerful is that they have the power to alter public opinion, which -- like it or not -- affects judicial outcomes.²¹ Indeed, civil rights activists over a half-century ago understood that attorneys stand a greater chance of success when legal arguments are in step with changes in the broader social milieu:²²

When the NAACP went to court to end segregation in the South, it coordinated with groups staging sit-ins, knowing that the resulting public unrest would help shape Thurgood Marshall’s legal victories in the courtroom. This strategy works because, right or wrong, judges keep an eye on the street. Internal notes from the Supreme Court’s deliberations in *Brown v. Board of Education* suggest the justices spent less time discussing law than chewing over the state of race relations in the South. In fact, as law professor Michael Klarman points out, little relevant constitutional law had changed between *Brown*’s ruling against segregation and *Plessy v. Ferguson*, the case that helped establish the “separate but equal” school regime. What had changed was the social context.²³

¹⁷ The Project Hamad website may be found at <http://www.projecthamad.org>.

¹⁸ Wood, *supra* note 12.

¹⁹ *Id.*

²⁰ *Id.*

²¹ *Id.*

²² *Id.*

²³ *Id.*

The implications of the above line of reasoning is that as democratized channels of information dissemination, like YouTube, attain greater portions of the media market, human rights advocates may turn with increasing frequency to online tools to favorably alter public opinion in the hopes that legal opinion will follow.²⁴ These advocates may also use the media and online tools to make international human rights court decisions more visible and ease the enforcement of such decisions.²⁵

Although human rights information can further human rights causes, lack of such information can also diminish human rights situations. For example, during the Cambodian genocide of 1975 through 1979, Pol Pot and his regime were "careful to deny observers access to their crime scenes" and journalists were forced to rely on eyewitness or second hand accounts.²⁶ Furthermore, since reporters are trained to authenticate their stories by visiting or corroborating with multiple sources, they tend to shy away from publishing critical accounts.²⁷ When they do print them, caveats and disclaimers are routinely added: "With almost every condemnation or citation of intelligence that appear in the press about Cambodia in 1975 and 1976, reporters included reminders that they had only "unconfirmed reports," "inconclusive accounts," or "very fragmentary information."²⁸ As one U.S. foreign service office stated, "[t]he refugees [crossing the border into Thailand] were telling tales that you could only describe as unbelievable," he remembers; "I kept on saying to myself, 'this can't be possible in this day and age.'"²⁹ Human rights information, aided by the media -- or horizontal and democratic channels of information dissemination -- is needed because human rights atrocities and crimes against humanity are not an easy things to wrap one's mind around,³⁰ and the outside world's reactions to each act of genocide has demonstrated a lack of willingness to believe eye-witness accounts, especially when the accuracy of those accounts necessitate the use of international action and force.³¹

C. The Power of Human Rights Information on the Internet

One reason the internet is such a powerful venue for the publication and dissemination of human rights information is that information available via the internet is, for the most part, downloadable, forwardable, and sharable. There is an infinite difference between the impact of a violation that occurs only once in history and a violation that can be downloaded and continually

²⁴ *Id.*

²⁵ See David Weissbrodt, *Strategies for the Selection and Pursuit of International Human Rights Objectives*, 8 YALE J. WORLD PUB. ORD. 62 (1981).

²⁶ SAMANTHA POWER, *A PROBLEM FROM HELL: AMERICAN AND THE AGE OF GENOCIDE* 109 (2003).

²⁷ *Id.*

²⁸ *Id.*

²⁹ *Id.*

³⁰ *Id.*

³¹ See generally *id.*

replayed on people's computers via mechanisms such as videoblogs, podcasts, and various internet websites. Once a violation has been captured as video or sound and frozen in time, it may be picked up by the media and transformed into a story for wider distribution. There are substantial benefits to having media recordings of human rights violations, as accounts of abuse which are captured orally or in writing may lose their impact, becoming mere words as events are rationalized or disputed. As stated in an advertisement for one human rights organization: "You can say a story was fabricated / You can say the jury was corrupt / You can say a document is false / You can say a person is lying / You can even say you don't trust newspapers / But you / Can't / Say / What you just saw / Never / Happened."³² Videos of police brutality, torture, and other gross human rights violations³³ speak for themselves.

The power of downloadable media is illustrated well by the 2007 spectacle in which CBS fired famous radio personality Don Imus over an on-air discussion during which Imus referred to the Rutgers University women's basketball team as a bunch of "nappy-headed hos." In a *New York Times* article about the incident, David Carr states that "30 years ago, if he made the same kind of remark, it would have *floated off into the ether* [emphasis added] -- the Federal Communications Commission, if it received complaints, might have taken notice, but few others."³⁴ But the present modern media paradigm is quite different than it was 30 years ago, largely because *Imus in the Morning* is downloadable.³⁵ Two days after Imus made the remarks, "reporters and advocates could click up the remark on the Media Matters for America Web site, and later YouTube, and see a vicious racial insult that delighted him visibly as it rolled off his tongue."³⁶ The internet has given the ether a lasting memory.³⁷

The internet has not only increased the longevity and availability of human rights information, but it has also given a voice to ordinary citizens and, to some extent, provided a means for the democratization of the power and ability to create news. In December, 2006, for example, one person armed with a camera phone was able to thwart a government-sanctioned spin on the execution of Saddam Hussein by posting an unofficial video of the execution to the internet only hours after Saddam's death.³⁸ The video sparked a large global debate surrounding the appropriateness of the death penalty in this day and age; the video also led to Iraqi government

³² Witness, <http://wearcam.org/reebok.mov>, Wearcam.org, at <http://wearcam.org/reebok.mov>.

³³ See, for example, *Egyptian Police Torturing a Woman Murder Suspect 2*, YouTube, at <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ZQom4edkHkw> (published Jan. 3, 2007).

³⁴ David Carr, *The Media Equation: Flying Solo Past the Point Of No Return*, NEW YORK TIMES, April 13, 2007, at C1.

³⁵ See *id.*

³⁶ See *id.*

³⁷ *Id.*

³⁸ See *Saddam Execution [cell phone footage]*, YouTube, at <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KknzwwgBrIr1s> (published Dec. 30, 2006).

investigations³⁹ into the execution, and comments from world leaders such as Tony Blair, who claimed that the execution was “completely wrong.”⁴⁰ The example of Saddam’s execution illustrates that, with the increased proliferation of electronics and audio/video capturing technologies, the ability to inform and help create news and other societal narratives has been opened up to a much larger demographic that includes citizens and persons not in traditional positions of power.

Interestingly, on December 10th, 2006 (human rights day), just 20 days before Saddam’s execution, the *New York Times Magazine* published an annual report entitled “The Year in Ideas,” which identified “sousveillance” as one of the formative ideas of 2006. Whereas “surveillance,” refers to “watching over” and “the monitoring of people by some higher authority -- the police, for instance,”⁴¹ sousveillance (also sometimes called “inverse surveillance”) refers to the “monitoring of authorities [by] . . . regular people, equipped with little more than cellphone cameras, video blogs and the desire to remain vigilant against the excesses of the powers that be.”⁴² Instances of sousveillance have increased with the spread of lightweight and cheap cameras and the increased presence of video sites like YouTube. The internet now is rife with citizen footage of gay-bashing in Latvia, union-busting in Zimbabwe, and civilian footage of police abuse in Malaysia.⁴³ As noted by Steve Mann et al.:

Surveillance cameras threaten autonomy. Shrouding cameras behind a bureaucracy results in somewhat grudging acceptance of their existence in order to participate in public activities By having this permanent record of the situation beyond the transaction, social control is enhanced. Acts of sousveillance redirect an establishment’s mechanisms and technologies of surveillance back on the establishment.⁴⁴

What is important about sousveillance is that it is a new mechanism of accountability for people who have been forgotten, abandoned, or simply left out by the media and both domestic and international courts, and whose plight has been ignored by the mainstream media. Sousveillance as a last-resort mechanism of accountability can be a powerful tool, since the most egregious acts of large-scale human rights abuses have occurred within informational vacuums in which international observers, foreign service

³⁹ *Iraq Investigates Saddam Footage*, BBC News, at http://news.bbc.co.uk/go/pr/fr/-/1/hi/world/middle_east/6224531.stm (Jan. 3, 2007).

⁴⁰ Alexis Unkovic, *Saddam Taunter Heard on Cell Phone Video to Face Iraqi Judges*, JURIST: LEGAL NEWS & RES. (2007), at <http://jurist.law.pitt.edu/paperchase/2007/01/saddam-taunter-heard-on-cell-phone.php>.

⁴¹ Jascha Hoffman, *The 6th Annual Year in Ideas/Sousveillance*, NEW YORK TIMES MAGAZINE, Dec. 10, 2006, at 74.

⁴² *Id.*

⁴³ *Id.* at 75.

⁴⁴ Steve Mann, Jason Nolan & Barry Wellman, *Sousveillance: Inventing and Using Wearable Computing Devices for Data Collection in Surveillance Environments*, 1 SURVEILLANCE & SOC’Y 331, 347 (2003).

workers, and journalists do not enter and information about atrocities does not escape to reach a wider audience.

D. The Facilitative Role of Human Rights Information Agencies

Of course, not every victim of human rights abuse is fortunate enough to be availed of representation, much less an attorney willing to go the distance on his or her behalf. But human rights advocates and victims with the means and knowledge to post their stories to the internet do have some hope, even if they do not write like journalists, and even if documented rights abuses are contained within raw and unproduced video clips that are shot with an unprofessional media recording device -- such as a cellular phone.

Once human rights stories do make it to the internet via a blog⁴⁵ or other venue for expression, there is hope. Over time, such postings are happening with greater frequency as people, ignored, negated, or misunderstood by the international media begin to take matters into their own hands by uploading video and pictures to the web, podcasting, and blogging.⁴⁶ Once a human rights story has been released on a blog, other bloggers can pick up the story, link to it, provide their own commentary, and thus promulgate the message to an even wider audience. In this manner, the narrative of a compelling human rights story may become viral, as the blogosphere of a country or geopolitical region gradually gets wind of someone's plight and as bloggers become united over a given issue. When critical mass develops, the mainstream media is likely to notice as in the case of Kareem Nabel Sulaiman: a blogger sentenced to several years in prison for slighting Islam and insulting the president of Egypt.⁴⁷

Blog aggregators such as Global Voices Online⁴⁸ are another type of venue for amplification of blogged human rights stories. Global Voices Online, which is part of the Berkman Center for Internet & Society at Harvard Law School, was launched in 2005 with funding from the MacArthur Foundation. It supports an international team of editor-bloggers who select, translate, and explain citizens' views and news from outside Western Europe and North America.⁴⁹ Global Voices states that they "[s]eek[] to aggregate, curate, and amplify the global conversation online -- shining light on places

⁴⁵ Due to the strong presence and interconnectedness of advocacy networks operating within the blogosphere, and technological factors that facilitate the discovery of information contained within blogs, there is a good argument for using blogs rather than other mechanisms for online dissemination. Cf. Sami S. Gharbia, *Lessons from the Free Kareem Campaign*, Global Voices Online, at <http://www.globalvoicesonline.org/2007/04/04/lessons-from-the-free-kareem-campaign/> (published April 4, 2007).

⁴⁶ Press Release, Rebecca Tabasky, Global Voices Online Awarded the Grand Prize for Innovations in Journalism from the Knight-Batten Foundation (Sept. 18, 2006), available at http://cyber.law.harvard.edu/home/newsroom/pressreleases/global_voices_wins_knight-batten_award.

⁴⁷ For more on Kareem Nabel Sulaiman's case, see Sami S. Gharbia, *Lessons from the Free Kareem Campaign*, Global Voices Online, at <http://www.globalvoicesonline.org/2007/04/04/lessons-from-the-free-kareem-campaign/> (published April 4, 2007).

⁴⁸ See Global Voices Online, at <http://www.globalvoicesonline.org>.

⁴⁹ Tabasky, *supra* note 42.

and people other media often ignore.⁵⁰ With tens of millions of bloggers globally, Global Voices serves to highlight critical bloggers and podcasters in countries and regions across the world,⁵¹ and they often amplify messages conveyed by bloggers -- particularly in the absence of mainstream media coverage and validation.⁵²

An additional noteworthy organization which has been launched to promote and facilitate citizenship journalism on the internet is Witness. Witness was formed in 1992 by musician Peter Gabriel after an ordinary citizen recorded Rodney King's beating at the hands of Los Angeles police officers, bringing international focus to the human rights situation in the United States.⁵³ Gabriel surmised that if a serendipitously recorded video could have such a powerful effect, an effort should be made to record international abuses more purposefully,⁵⁴ and he joined with the Reebok Human Rights Foundation and the Lawyers Committee on Human Rights to start Witness. In 2006, Witness and Global Voices Online launched a content partnership to form a human rights video network "to amplify human rights-related video being uploaded onto the Internet by concerned citizens around the world."⁵⁵ The video network, presently in its pilot stage, is a curated forum. The final version of the network will include three sections: (1) a video viewing section, (2) an uploading section, and (3) a "get active" section, which will seek to empower users by providing access to online community and advocacy tools.⁵⁶

E. Human Rights Information Workers on the Internet

Although there are a number of different roles for human rights information workers on the internet, the present section of this article is primarily concerned with the roles of violation capturers, front-line and bridge bloggers, and aggregation and amplification bloggers. This section also discusses the need for greater involvement of library and information workers, documentalists, and archivists. It should be noted that is possible and even likely that one person will fill more than one of the roles discussed below.

⁵⁰ *About Global Voices Online*, Global Voices Online, at <http://www.globalvoicesonline.org/about/>.

⁵¹ *Id.*

⁵² *Id.*

⁵³ Dana Hughes, *Making the Whole World a Witness*, YES! MAG. (2004), available at <http://www.yesmagazine.com/article.asp?ID=713>.

⁵⁴ *Id.*

⁵⁵ Tabasky, *supra* note 42.

⁵⁶ *The Human Rights Video Hub Functionality and Structure*, Witness, at http://www.witness.org/index.php?option=com_content&task=view&id=577.

1. Violation Documenters

Violation documenters witness human rights violations and capture them in text, audio, or video. They may post the captured human rights violation to the internet themselves, or this may be done for them by front-line or first-instance blogger. Often they are themselves victims of the violation or at least members of a repressed group; however these documenters may also be human rights violators recording a violation for their own amusement. Violation documenters are likely to be citizen journalists using sousveillance as a means to air their grievances, and they typically use whatever means at their disposal to document abuses. The activities of violation documenters frequently put them at risk, as they have been responsible for videos of the Guinean Army firing indiscriminately on demonstrating civilians;⁵⁷ torture and police brutality in Egypt,⁵⁸ clashes between police and students in China,⁵⁹ and anti-gay violence in Moscow.⁶⁰

2. Front-Line and Bridge Bloggers

Regardless of format, front-line bloggers are the first to actually post evidence of human rights violations to the internet. They may have documented violations themselves or they may be posting someone else's information. Like violation documenters, their activities often put them at risk of state sanctioned reprisals such as imprisonment or torture. Front-line bloggers are sometimes called "bridge bloggers" because they bring information about their local situations to a global audience and disseminate information from places of little power to places of greater power. Bridge bloggers, for example, can convey information from immigrant communities

⁵⁷ Gavin Simpson, *Guinea-Conakry: Standing Up to a Power-Hungry President*, Global Voices Online, at <http://www.globalvoicesonline.org/2007/03/13/guinea-conakry-standing-up-to-a-power-hungry-president/> (published March 13, 2007).

⁵⁸ See *التعذيب في المعتقلات المصري* [Torture Incident Involving Egyptian Police Sodomizing Emad Mohamed Ali Kabeer], YouTube, at <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4iez20eP-ic> (published Nov. 22, 2006); Hossam el-Hamalawy, *Victim of Police Rape Video Identified*, 3arabawy, at <http://arabist.net/arabawy/2006/12/09/victim-of-police-rape-video-identified/> (published Dec. 9, 2006); *Egyptian Police Torturing a Woman Murder Suspect 2*, supra note 29; *Egyptian Police Torture 2*, YouTube, at <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=03RXZkv3qhU> (published Nov. 7, 2006); Moustafa Ayad, *The Next Page: A Digital Uprising Against Thug Government*, PITTSBURGH POST-GAZETTE, April 15, 2007, at <http://www.post-gazette.com/pg/07105/778143-109.stm>; Sameer Padania, *Egypt: Bloggers Open the Door to Police Brutality Debate*, Global Voices Online, at <http://www.globalvoicesonline.org/2006/12/09/egypt-bloggers-open-the-door-to-police-brutality-debate/> (published Dec. 9, 2006).

⁵⁹ *江西省南昌市江西服装学院骚乱(视象资料 23/10)* [Chinese Police Dispersing Student Protesters], YouTube, at <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=sZsmyYdsoq4> (published Oct. 28, 2006); see also *China: Videos Emerge of Clashes Between Police and Students in Jiangxi*, YouTube, at <http://www.globalvoicesonline.org/2006/11/24/china-videos-emerge-of-clashes-between-police-and-students-in-jiangxi/> (published Nov. 24, 2006).

⁶⁰ See *Gay Pride in Moscow Attacked by Fascists*, YouTube, at <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VXHzoONni-k> (published May 28, 2006).

to non-immigrant communities, from citizens to politicians, and from the religious communities to secular communities.⁶¹

3. Aggregation and Amplification Bloggers

Aggregation bloggers are often scavengers of sometimes obscure and disparate sources of information, and they collect, and sometimes repackage or translate this information in a manner that makes it more accessible. They present a third tier in the information distribution chain. Aggregation bloggers often work for NGOs, libraries, or special interest groups such as Amnesty International. The blogger-editors working for Global Voices Online, mentioned earlier in this article, are examples of aggregation bloggers and people rely upon them to find, publish, translate, and sometimes editorialize the "good sources." In a chapter entitled "'Conscience Trigger': The Press and Human Rights,"⁶² Anna Husarska discusses guidelines that he implements when covering human rights stories. At least four of these guidelines may be of use to aggregation and amplification bloggers:

[B]ecause interaction between the media and the human rights communities is most desperately needed in developing countries and those countries that are in a state of civil war, I draw on examples from these areas. I do not discuss stable countries that suffer from long-standing, isolated human rights abuses. These abuses usually have already become the subject of scrutiny by lobbying groups, specialized media, and other mechanisms.

. . . [A]lthough some conflicts generate heavy media coverage, I focus . . . on situations when a human rights case is not already big news. In these circumstances, the media have the opportunity to influence the human rights agenda in a more powerful way.

. . . I do not discuss specialized legal, human rights, and political journals that play a completely different role from that of daily news or weekly magazine reporting. These publications can supply an invaluable record to those interested, but they usually preach to the converted, and constitute less of a tool for the advancement of human rights

. . . [S]ince the role of foreign media covering human rights abuses is very different from that of local media, I bring examples only from the media that are foreign to the problems they describe. Countries in which human rights violations are notorious usually lack a free media, so the local media are not a great help in promoting human rights, and indeed often themselves need outside help. A few courageous outlets may hang on and, because they operate in the local language with local journalists and newsreaders, occasionally

⁶¹ See Hossein Derakhshan, *Weblogestan: How weblogs are affecting Iran*, Editor: Myself: A weblog on Iran, Technology and Pop Culture, at <http://hoder.com/weblog/archives/013982.shtml> (published April 29, 2006); See REPORTERS WITHOUT BORDERS, HANDBOOK FOR BLOGGERS AND CYBER-DISSIDENTS 41 (2005).

⁶² Anna Husarska, *Conscience Trigger: The Press and Human Rights*, in REALIZING HUMAN RIGHTS 336 (2002).

they can reach the local population. Belgrade's Radio B-92, Minsk's Radio 101.2, Port-au-Prince's Radio Soleil, and the Algerian newspapers EI Watan and La Nation are examples.⁶³

F. The Plight of Bloggers and other Human Rights Information Workers

Restrictions on information workers' freedom of expression may take a variety of forms.⁶⁴ A state may criminalize defamation, fail to investigate crimes against the media, fail to enact freedom of information laws or laws that prohibit monopoly ownership of the media, censor speech, harass the media or individual journalists, and require the compulsory licensing of journalists.⁶⁵ A victim of freedom of expression restrictions that violate international law may have no domestic legal recourse, either because jurists and judges are too frightened to enforce the law or because national laws protecting expression are nonexistent.⁶⁶

Unfortunately, repression of human rights information workers does not stop with violations of the freedom of expression. Information workers are often faced with threats of life, liberty, and security of person. To be sure, speaking up takes audacity and can have serious consequences depending on where one lives.⁶⁷ For example, in Iran authorities have targeted internet journalists and websites in an effort to curtail online dissemination of information and news.⁶⁸

Between September and November of 2004, the judiciary detained and tortured more than twenty bloggers and Internet journalists, and subjected them to lengthy solitary confinement. The government systematically blocks websites with political news and analysis from inside Iran and abroad. On February 2, 2005, a court in the province of Gilan sentenced Arash Sigarchi to fourteen years in prison for his online writings. In August 2005, the judiciary sentenced another blogger, Mojtaba Saminejad, to two years in prison for "insulting" Iran's leaders.⁶⁹

⁶³ *Id.*

⁶⁴ Jo M. Pasqualucci, *Criminal Defamation and the Evolution of the Doctrine of Freedom of Expression in International Law: Comparative Jurisprudence of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights*, 39 VAND. J. TRANSNAT'L L. 379 (2006).

⁶⁵ *Id.* at 379.

⁶⁶ *Id.* at 382.

⁶⁷ Human Rights Watch, *Blog for Human Rights*, Human Rights Watch, at <http://hrw.org/blogs.htm>.

⁶⁸ *Id.*

⁶⁹ *Id.*

As the example of Iran illustrates, threatened information workers often become objects "of punitive government action for . . . reason[s] aside from the commission of . . . criminal act[s]." ⁷⁰ That is, a "threatened information worker" is any information worker who has been "executed, imprisoned, tortured, threatened with imprisonment, interrogated, threatened with any type of government-assisted reprisals or threatened by a private citizen or group with the connivance of the government for any reason not clearly and legitimately criminal in nature." ⁷¹

G. The Rights of Human Rights Information Workers and Information Seekers

The freedom of bloggers to flow information across national borders using any media at their disposal is solidly established as a fundamental human right. This right is important because violations of the right to freedom of expression often go hand-in-hand with other human rights violations, particularly violations of the right to freedom of assembly and association. ⁷² International laws regarding information provision and reception have long histories, and the scope of this article will not permit an exhaustive review of these laws as promulgated by the United Nations and regional intergovernmental organizations such as the European Union and the Organization of American States. A cursory review, however, of how the most widely-ratified treaties and most influential declarations protect human rights information workers -- and all information providers and consumers, for that matter -- will be provided.

Before any human rights declarations or treaties had been adopted ⁷³ by the United Nations (UN), its General Assembly adopted resolution 59(I) ⁷⁴ during its first session. Resolution 59(I) states that "[f]reedom of information is a fundamental human right and . . . the touchstone of all the freedoms to which the United Nations is consecrated." ⁷⁵ Additionally, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights (Universal Declaration) ⁷⁶ states in Article 19 that "[e]veryone has the right to the freedom of opinion and expression; this right includes freedom to hold opinions without interference and to seek, receive and impart information and ideas through *any media and regardless of frontiers* [emphases added]." Such a definition is sufficiently broad to protect the practice of blogging and internet browsing, and the inclusion of Article 19 in the Universal Declaration is significant

⁷⁰ *How do we Define Threatened Bloggers?*, Global Voices Online, at http://www.globalvoicesonline.org/wiki/article/How_do_we_define_threatened_bloggers%3F.

⁷¹ *Id.*

⁷² *Id.*

⁷³ *Guide on the Human Right to Freedom of Expression*, Human Rights Education Associates, at <http://www.hrea.org/learn/guides/freedom-of-expression.html>.

⁷⁴ See <http://daccessdds.un.org/doc/RESOLUTION/GEN/NR0/033/10/IMG/NR003310.pdf>.

⁷⁵ *Id.*

⁷⁶ Universal Declaration of Human Rights, G.A. res. 217A (III), U.N. Doc A/810 at 71 (1948).

because several of the Declaration's provisions -- arguably including Article 19 -- have become customary international law.⁷⁷

Further strengthening the rights articulated in Article 19 of the Universal Declaration are a number of so-called "hard law"⁷⁸ treaties which have given effect to these rights.⁷⁹ For example, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights,⁸⁰ which has been ratified by 160 nations -- including the United States and gross human rights violators such as Egypt, Sudan, and Guinea -- states in its 19th article that "[e]veryone shall have the right to freedom of expression; this right shall include freedom to seek, receive and impart information and ideas of all kinds, regardless of frontiers, either orally, in writing or in print, in the form of art, *or through any other media of his choice* [emphasis added]." Likewise, the Convention on the Rights of the Child,⁸¹ which is the most widely-ratified treaty in existence today with 193 States parties, similarly states that "[t]he child shall have the right to freedom of expression; this right shall include freedom to seek, receive and impart information and ideas of all kinds, regardless of frontiers . . . through any other media of the child's choice."⁸² Furthermore, the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination⁸³ provides that "States Parties undertake to prohibit and to eliminate racial discrimination in all its forms and to guarantee the right of everyone, without distinction as to race, colour, or national or ethnic origin, to equality before the law, notably in the enjoyment of [t]he right to freedom of opinion and expression[.]"⁸⁴ Indeed, "[r]acial and ethnic minorities equally should not be discriminated against and have equal access to airing their views and sharing information of concern to them."⁸⁵

In addition to the above-mentioned United Nations protections, a number of regional treaties have given effect to the right to obtain and seek information. Indeed, every major regional human rights convention --

⁷⁷ Hurst Hannum, *The Status and Future of the Customary International Law of Human Rights: The Status of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights in National and International Law*, 25 GA. J. INT'L & COMP. L. 287, 289 (1996) (quoting Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action, World Conference on Human Rights, 22d plen. mtg. (June 25, 1993), pmb., paragraphs 3, 8, U.N. Doc. A/CONF.157/24 (Part 1) at 20-46 (1993), reprinted in 32 I.L.M. 1661 (1993)).

⁷⁸ Hard law is generally considered to be written law that is both enforceable and binding.

⁷⁹ *Guide on the Human Right to Freedom of Expression*, Human Rights Education Associates, at <http://www.hrea.org/learn/guides/freedom-of-expression.html>.

⁸⁰ International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, G.A. res. 2200A (XXI), 21 U.N. GAOR Supp. (No. 16) at 52, U.N. Doc. A/6316 (1966), 999 U.N.T.S. 171, entered into force Mar. 23, 1976.

⁸¹ Convention on the Rights of the Child, G.A. res. 44/25, annex, 44 U.N. GAOR Supp. (No. 49) at 167, U.N. Doc. A/44/49 (1989), entered into force Sept. 2 1990.

⁸² *Id.* art. 13.

⁸³ International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, G.A. res. 2106 (XX), Annex, 20 U.N. GAOR Supp. (No. 14) at 47, U.N. Doc. A/6014 (1966), 660 U.N.T.S. 195, entered into force Jan. 4, 1969.

⁸⁴ *Id.* art. 5.

⁸⁵ *Guide on the Human Right to Freedom of Expression*, Human Rights Education Associates, at <http://www.hrea.org/learn/guides/freedom-of-expression.html>.

including the [European] Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, the American Convention on Human Rights, and the African [Banjul] Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights -- contains protections for information seekers and providers. For example, the [European] Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms⁸⁶ states that "[e]veryone has the right to freedom of expression [and] . . . [t]his right shall include freedom to hold opinions and to receive and impart information and ideas without interference by public authority and regardless of frontiers."⁸⁷ The American Convention on Human Rights contains almost identical language as Article 19 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and similar provisions are also contained in the African [Banjul] Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights.⁸⁸ Furthermore, the African Charter states in Article 9 that "[e]very individual shall have the right to express and disseminate his opinions within the law."⁸⁹

Although the justiciability of freedom of expression rights as articulated in the above international and regional treaties is strong, the rights of human rights information workers is most potently articulated by the Declaration on the Right and Responsibility of Individuals, Groups and Organs of Society to Promote and Protect Universally Recognized Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms.⁹⁰ This declaration, created and affirmed by the U.N. General Assembly, states that "[e]veryone has the right, individually and in association with others . . . [t]o know, seek, obtain, receive and hold information about all human rights and . . . [t]o publish, impart or disseminate to others views, information and knowledge on all human rights and fundamental freedoms."⁹¹ The Declaration also provides that all individuals have the right "[t]o study, discuss, form and hold opinions

⁸⁶ [European] Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, *opened for signature* 4 November 1950, 213 U.N.T.S. 221, Europ. T.S. No. 5, art. 1, *entered into force* 3 Sept. 1953.

⁸⁷ *Id.* art. 10. It should be noted that Article 10 also states the following:

The exercise of these freedoms, since it carries with it duties and responsibilities, may be subject to such formalities, conditions, restrictions or penalties as are prescribed by law and are necessary in a democratic society, in the interests of national security, territorial integrity or public safety, for the prevention of disorder or crime, for the protection of health or morals, for the protection of the reputation or rights of others, for preventing the disclosure of information received in confidence, or for maintaining the authority and impartiality of the judiciary. *Id.*

⁸⁸ African [Banjul] Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights, adopted June 27, 1981, OAU Doc. CAB/LEG/67/3 rev. 5, 21 I.L.M. 58 (1982), *entered into force* Oct. 21, 1986.

⁸⁹ *Id.* art. 9. It should be noted that there are some important and significant caveats to the freedom of expression language articulated in many of the above mentioned instruments. For example, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights states that the exercise of the right to freedom of expression, "since it carries with it duties and responsibilities," may be subject to:

such formalities, conditions, restrictions or penalties as are prescribed by law and are necessary in a democratic society, in the interests of national security, territorial integrity or public safety, for the prevention of disorder or crime, for the protection of health or morals, for the protection of the reputation or rights of others, for preventing the disclosure of information received in confidence, or for maintaining the authority and impartiality of the judiciary. *Id.*

⁹⁰ Declaration on the Right and Responsibility of Individuals, Groups and Organs of Society to Promote and Protect Universally Recognized Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, G.A. res.53/144, annex, 53 U.N. GAOR Supp., U.N. Doc. U.N. Doc. A/RES/53/144 (1999).

⁹¹ *Id.* art. 6.

on the observance . . . of all human rights and . . . to draw public attention to those matters” and “to develop and discuss new human rights ideas and principles and to advocate their acceptance.”⁹² Furthermore, Article 13 states that “[e]veryone has the right, individually and in association with others, to solicit, receive and utilize resources for the express purpose of promoting and protecting human rights and fundamental freedoms through peaceful means, in accordance with article 3 of the present Declaration.”⁹³

H. Concluding Thoughts

In 1995, Pulitzer Prize winning author Samantha Power asked Bosnian civilians in Sarajevo where they would go if able to escape.⁹⁴ The majority of Bosnians picked one of the many beautiful beaches along the Adriatic. In the summer of 2004, she asked the same question of genocide victims in the Sudanese province of Darfur who had seen their children butchered, their women raped, their homes torched, and their families murdered. The “surprisingly common answer, whether from refugees wandering the Sahara, or from farmers who had never had electricity or running water, was this: ‘The Hague.’”⁹⁵ The Darfurians were aware that there was an international court in the Netherlands and they wanted to testify.⁹⁶ Unfortunately, most Darfurians will not have the opportunity to travel to The Hague and testify before the International Criminal Court.

Despite the International Criminal Court’s inaccessibility for most Darfurians, the genocide in Sudan will likely go down as the most extensively documented genocide since the holocaust, and the most widely “observed” genocide to date. In contrast to the Cambodian genocide discussed earlier in this article, the Darfurian genocide does not appear to be occurring in a vacuum. Indeed, because of modern technology and the internet, one can easily find footage of Darfurian devastation, hear the testimony of war crimes victims, and view pictures that evidence unspeakable atrocities. Furthermore, destroyed villages are monitored on Google Earth and incidences are documented days after they occur, almost as if the genocide is monitored in real-time. To be sure, the roughly 200 million people who have downloaded Google Earth since its launch are able to view locations of damaged and destroyed Sudanese villages, high-resolution satellite imagery of burned homes and communities, survivor interviews and event narratives linked to villages of occurrence, and geospatially indexed evidentiary photographs.

Unfortunately, while embarrassing evidence may be enough to motivate governments to release prisoners of conscience or crack down on

⁹² *Id.* art. 7.

⁹³ *Id.* art. 13.

⁹⁴ Samantha Power, *Court of First Resort*, NEW YORK TIMES, Feb. 10, 2005, at A23.

⁹⁵ *Id.*

⁹⁶ *Id.*

police brutality, internet advocacy campaigns have done little to prompt military intervention, or even aggressive diplomacy, for the sake of victims of gross human rights violations in foreign locals such as Darfur. Furthermore, genocidal governments and militia groups such as the Sudanese Janjaweed often have no regard for the perceptions of the international community and tend to prefer political isolation. They are impervious to political pressure. For the time being, then, it appears that online advocacy is most effective when applied to situations whose remedy requires little governmental effort (e.g. the release of a prisoner of conscience). Nonetheless, the internet remains unrivaled in its ability to provide information on crises such as the one in Darfur, and it has in many cases provided the only vehicle for present-day genocide victims -- aided by humanitarian workers, the independent media, and concerned volunteers -- to tell their stories, relate their accounts, and air their grievances. When the next devastating humanitarian crisis does occur -- as it surely will -- victims may, like the Darfurians, seek to testify before international courts. If the proliferation and prevalence of internet technologies persist, however, these future victims may also seek a second desirable venue for bearing their testimony: the internet. If and when future human rights victims and witnesses do post their stories to the internet, a much more established and advanced infrastructure of information technologies, information workers, and advocacy tools must be in place to help these future victims document their stories and air their grievances. Advances in both human rights advocacy tactics and the number of human rights advocates are needed to ensure that testimonies about future atrocities are amplified and directly or indirectly spur governments to action.

Human rights information is like other forms of information in that it must be well organized, cataloged, and managed if it is to benefit the greatest number of persons. But whereas human rights information might, in some regards, necessitate the same maintenance and organizational treatment as other forms of information, one must not fail to recognize that human rights information differs from other genres of information for the simple fact that it is much more critical. Human rights information -- in specific contexts and during crucial moments -- holds the potential to save lives, prevent murder, stop state-sponsored terrorism, and generally further the cause of human rights. It is for this reason that librarians and other information workers -- as experts in information organization, delivery, and promotion -- should be front and center in the fight for distribution of sousveillance media, for the dissemination of information from the poor to the rich, and for advancing mechanisms and technologies that promote freedom of expression in political environments that favor censorship. It is because of the very importance of human rights information that information workers should not wait until funds have been established, a vision has been crafted, and a proper job description constructed before putting their skills to use. To be sure, the efforts of information scientists and librarians are sorely needed in the struggle for human rights and the time to act is now.

Selected Sources:

Egyptian Police Torturing a Woman Murder Suspect 2 [viewer discretion is advised], YouTube, at <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ZQom4edkHkw> (published Jan. 3, 2007).

el-Hamalawy, Hossam, *Victim of Police Rape Video Identified*, 3arabawy, at <http://arabist.net/arabawy/2006/12/09/victim-of-police-rape-video-identified/> (published Dec. 9, 2006).

Gay Pride in Moscow Attacked by Fascists, YouTube, at <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VXHzoONni-k> (published May 28, 2006).

Global Voices Online, at <http://www.globalvoicesonline.org/>.

Human Rights in Egypt [viewer discretion is advised], YouTube, at http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jyLMHoe_130 (published Aug. 31, 2006).

Human Rights Watch, *Blog for Human Rights*, Human Rights Watch, at <http://hrw.org/blogs.htm>.

Husarska, Anna, *Conscience Trigger: The Press and Human Rights*, in REALIZING HUMAN RIGHTS 336 (2002).

Irrepressible.info: An Amnesty International Campaign, at <http://irrepressible.info>.

Padania, Sameer, *Egypt: Bloggers Open the Door to Police Brutality Debate*, Global Voices Online, at <http://www.globalvoicesonline.org/2006/12/09/egypt-bloggers-open-the-door-to-police-brutality-debate/> (published Dec. 9, 2006).

REPORTERS WITHOUT BORDERS, HANDBOOK FOR BLOGGERS AND CYBER-DISSIDENTS 41 (2005), at http://www.rsf.org/IMG/pdf/Bloggers_Handbook2.pdf.

William Teesdale et al., *Guantánamo Unclassified*, YouTube, at <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=D5E3w7ME6Fs> (last modified Jan. 5, 2007).

WITNESS, at <http://www.witness.org/>.

WITNESS, *Rights Alerts [Videos]*, at http://www.witness.org/index.php?option=com_rightsalert.

WITNESS, *VIDEO HUB blog: A vision for a Human Rights video portal*, at <http://www.witness.org/vhblog/>.

Information for Social Change Issue 25

WITNESS and Global Voices Online, *Human Rights Video Hub Pilot*, Global Voices Online, at <http://globalvoicesonline.org/-/human-rights-video/>.

المصري المعتقلات في التعذيب [Torture Incident Involving Egyptian Police Sodomizing Emad Mohamed Ali Kabear] [viewer discretion is strongly advised], YouTube, at <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4iez20eP-ic> (published Nov. 22, 2006)

江西省南昌市江西服装学院骚乱(视象资料 23/10) [Chinese Police Dispersing Student Protesters], YouTube, at <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=sZsmyYdsoq4> (published Oct. 28, 2006).

A Library for Peace: the Commonweal Collection

Ellie Clement
Alison Cullingford

Introduction

The Commonweal⁹⁷ Collection is a unique, independent, specialist library devoted to non-violent social change. Holding over 11000 books and pamphlets and over 100 journal titles, it was established in 1958 by David Hoggett, and moved to the University of Bradford in 1975, where one of the trustees, Nigel Young, was lecturing in the newly established Department of Peace Studies⁹⁸. This article tells the story of Commonweal and its remarkable founder and discusses the time it has spent in Bradford at the University, and also outlines two exciting new projects, the Children's Mobile Peace Library, and Treehouse (home to the Bradford Centre for Nonviolence). Commonweal is also, as Trustee Andrew Rigby wrote "A space of and for peace which bears witness to the life of its founder"⁹⁹

David Hoggett

David Hoggett¹⁰⁰ (1929-1975) was born in Bristol, later moving to Cheltenham, where he worked in the Public Library on leaving school. Aged 18 in 1947, he was conscripted for National Service. Although he reached the rank of Sergeant and apparently became a "crack shot", he had been interested in ideas of pacifism from his early teens and "the direct cause of deciding to leave Her Majesty's army was the reading of 'The power of non-violence' by Richard Gregg"¹⁰¹. He refused further service, becoming a conscientious objector, for which he was interned in Wormwood Scrubs, later, at a tribunal electing to work in forestry.

After National Service, he joined the International Voluntary Service for Peace, helping in work camps in post-war Europe. In 1952, he travelled to India, where he spent three years, the first two with IVSP and a further year

⁹⁷ *Commonweal* means the common good or the welfare of the community.

⁹⁸ University of Bradford, Department of Peace Studies *Website* [online] <http://www.brad.ac.uk/acad/peace/> [accessed 10th November 2006].

⁹⁹ Rank, C., (eds.) (1997) *City for Peace : Bradford's story* Bradford: MCB, p. 155

¹⁰⁰ This account draws extensively on the early chapters of Barlow, S., (1999) *The Commonweal Collection : the story of a library for a non-violent world*. Bradford: Commonweal Collection.

¹⁰¹ Hoggett, D., (1996). *Travels of an International Voluntary Service worker: a series of newsletters written to personal friends 1950-1960*. Bradford: Commonweal Collection, p.63.

building houses. India was to have a huge influence on David's thinking and later life, in particular the "Bhoodan" land gift movement, based on the Gandhian ideal of "Sarvodaya", a transformed society based on non-violence. On returning from India in 1955, David trained as a carpenter, believing that practical skills were a way to achieve such transformation and using these skills on his holidays to work for IVSP in Europe. In 1956, he was building homes for refugees in Austria, when he fell twenty feet from a roof onto a concrete floor, fracturing his fifth cervical vertebra.



c/o Commonweal & Copyright owner unknown.

He nearly died. However, he recovered, paralysed from the chest down, with some feeling and movement in the right hand. After a year in hospitals, David was able to return to the family home in Cheltenham, where he learned to type using rods attached to his arms, and became involved in the local work of CND and of the Direct Action Committee. He also read widely and built up a fine collection of books, journals and pamphlets on peace and nonviolence, appealing to his wide circle of contacts to donate more to form this library. Alfred Heslegrave, another volunteer with IVSP, became his life-long companion and carer. In 1958, David's work on behalf of refugees was recognised by award of the Nansen Medal by the United Nations Association. David, typically, accepted it on behalf of all who did such work.

In 1959, Garthnewydd Community House in Merthyr Tydfil was established by David and friends from the Fellowship of Friends of Truth as "an experiment in applying the social philosophy of M.K. Gandhi, that is, in nonviolent living"¹⁰². With David and Alfred came the growing collection of books, now supplemented by the library of the FFT and further donations

¹⁰² Hoggett, D., (1996), p.79.

from friends in the UK and in India. By February 1960, it comprised 400 volumes, "primarily of value to those interested in Sarvodaya, pacifism, philosophy, world religions and mysticism"¹⁰³. David called the library "Commonweal", which he considered to be the best English-language equivalent of "Sarvodaya". Soon requests to use this resource were received from peace activists across the country, and a postal library service began to take shape, masterminded by David, who arranged cataloguing and classification and sought donations from writers and publishers.

Eventually the Garthnewydd community dispersed. David and the collection moved with one of the families from the community to a cottage nearby, where he stayed for three years. He organised the Library to run very effectively on minimal resources (running expenses were £1 a week in 1963) and he also had the vision to look beyond his own lifetime to secure Commonweal's long-term future by creating the Commonweal Trust, to ensure the survival of the library and its Gandhian ethos when he could no longer run it. The original trustees were David himself, his cousin April Carter, and two friends, Donald Groom and Devi Prasad.

David later moved back to the family home in Cheltenham, where he devoted himself to the work of Commonweal. In 1965, he received a "POSSUM" typewriter, which he operated at first by a suck-blow mechanism and later by a rod attached to his hand. This wonderful machine freed him from reliance on others to type for him. With the help of Alfred and volunteers, David managed the loan system, wrote detailed and helpful replies to enquirers, appealed for donations of books and money, catalogued and indexed, and created bibliographies on key subjects. Sylvia Barlow's book contains many comments on David's incredible knowledge of the collection and the excellent service he provided¹⁰⁴. The collection had now grown from 800-900 volumes at the creation of the Trust Deed to 3000 volumes in 1974.

In 1975, David fell very ill with a serious urinary infection: he died on November 15th. The power of the written word could be said to have changed his life, when he refused military service after reading Gregg's book; the Library he founded has continued to provide inspiration for others in the same way.

J.B. Priestley Library

Following David's death the Trustees¹⁰⁵ of Commonweal looked for somewhere else for the library to be housed. According to Sylvia Barlow¹⁰⁶ three options were considered; split the library and distribute it between other peace libraries, move the library to a communal living project in

¹⁰³ Hoggett, D., (1996), p.73.

¹⁰⁴ Barlow, S., (1999), p.14-16.

¹⁰⁵ The Commonweal Collection became an organisation governed by a deed of trust in 1963.

¹⁰⁶ Barlow, S. (1999), p.19

Tenbury or move to the University of Bradford with its Peace Studies department. After much debate the last was chosen at least in part because of the security and continuity of the collection, also because the "openness, sympathy and generosity of the librarians at Bradford is tremendous – they are really interested in it"¹⁰⁷. This has been shown over the last 30 years in housing the collection and offering a small amount of clerical support.

The agreement was that the Trustees retained ownership of the materials, but that they were to be permanently deposited with the University. The title "Commonweal Collection" was to be retained and the collection was housed separately within the library building¹⁰⁸. The University also undertook to provide a separate catalogue (once printed, now available online through the University catalogue <http://ipac.brad.ac.uk>) and maintain access for outside users, and that "the collection would be available for research and study purposes within the University Library for anyone wishing to use it".¹⁰⁹ A "Joint Consultative Committee" of two Trustees and two representatives of the University was established to discuss matters concerning the collection.

The integration of a radical collection with a "traditional" University library was not an easy one, and circulation and classification both posed problems. The move to the University saw the end of the postal loans service, but did allow continued access to the collections through Inter-Library Loans.¹¹⁰ The housing of the Collection within the University did nothing to reduce the dependence of Commonweal upon donations. There has never been much in the way of an acquisitions budget, instead the collection is dependent upon the generosity of authors and publishers working on peace and nonviolence. The Trustees appointed a part-time paid co-ordinator in 1976 to oversee the move and re-establishment of the library in its new location. From 1977 a workgroup of volunteers was established, this group (comprised of local interested parties and also students and researchers from the department of Peace Studies) continued much of the maintenance of the collection. The use of a group of to undertake much of the "work" fitted well with the decentralist philosophy of Commonweal (if the University library viewed it as unconventional" library practice¹¹¹). As much of the group was constituted from a transient student population this worked with limited success, regularly having large sections of the workgroup experiencing essay crises and long vacations away from Bradford and the collection.

The Co-ordinator's role has been funded by donations and grants obtained by the trustees, and money has always been in short supply. In 2004, funding

¹⁰⁷ Young, N, (1976) letter to Bob Overy quoted in Barlow (1999) p.20

¹⁰⁸ Commonweal has its own classification system created by David Hoggett, an outline schema can be found at: <http://www.brad.ac.uk/library/services/commonweal/cwlclassificationlist.pdf>

¹⁰⁹ Barlow, S, (1999) p.24

¹¹⁰ Barlow, S. (1999) p.22, for many involved in the peace movement interaction with an institutional library may not be as straight forward as an "anonymous" postal loan from a small sympathetic organisation.

¹¹¹ Barlow, S, (1999) p.23

for the co-ordinator's post ran out. This is not the only time the collection has been left dependent upon the work of volunteers alone, a five month period in 1984/5 also saw a lack of co-ordinator. The day to day running of the collection is now overseen by the workgroup co-ordinator (a paid role of only 10 hours per month), who cannot realistically undertake to do more than answer post and organise the workgroup of volunteers to undertake the necessary maintenance tasks. The Joint Consultative Committee still oversee the relationship between the J.B. Priestley Library and the Commonweal Collection.

The Commonweal Archives

Commonweal has collected over seventy significant archive collections: "the heart of the archival holdings is made up of material donated by those who either knew David or shared his commitment to exploring and experimenting with the potentialities of nonviolence in all its many dimensions"¹¹² The core collections are those concerning the nonviolent direct action movement of the 1950s and 1960s; other strengths include the 1980s anti-nuclear movement, archives of organisations such as Peace News, and the archives of individual researchers.

The lack of staffing continuity and, in particular, the loss of funding for the co-ordinator's role made the trustees realise the need to safeguard these important archives. Since 2000, the J.B. Priestley Library has had Special Collections staff, with the necessary practical, legal and user service expertise to manage the University's archive and rare book collections effectively. For Special Collections to manage the archives, with continued input from the trustees, seemed the obvious way forward. In September 2005, the Commonweal Archives were formally transferred to the J.B. Priestley Library. There is much work on cataloguing and preservation to be done to make these resources widely available and external funding will be sought. It is in keeping with Commonweal's mission that, as with all the Special Collections, these archives will be open to all¹¹³

Children's peace library

One of the new directions Commonweal has taken in the last few years is the establishment of a Children's Mobile Peace Library. This was the brainchild of Heather Blakey, Commonweal co-ordinator (2000-2001) and now a Trustee. She felt that it was important to provide access to a wide range of materials on peace for children and it was a gap which did not seem to be filled. The process of establishing the library took some time, after much work by co-ordinators Sally Fildes-Moss and Noa Kleinman, funding of £13000 was finally

¹¹² Rigby, A., (1997) Description of archives held by the Commonweal Collection January 1997, reproduced in Barlow, S., (1999), Appendix B.

¹¹³ Further information about the Commonweal Archives can be found on their web page: <http://www.brad.ac.uk/library/special/cwlarchives.php>

awarded by the Paul Hamlyn Foundation in 2004 for a co-ordinator for the project 10 hours a week for 12 months. Peter Moore took on this role, Peter said "There is a hunger in Bradford for fresh ideas on how we can get children to live together peacefully. This Commonweal project allowed our storytellers to share these ideas and through fun stories build bridges for peace."¹¹⁴

The library was established to *travel to* children from particularly disadvantaged backgrounds. This aim was met through a series of community events and storytelling at the Bradford Central Library, in total 568 children attended the 40 events, of whom 56% were female, 69% BME¹¹⁵ and 2% disabled¹¹⁶. A pool of storytellers was established, and the storytelling is continuing in the Library's new home at Treehouse.

The library holds books on "positive peace", so includes material not only on peace and nonviolence, but also on issues to help children lead a fulfilling life, such as dealing with bullying, self-confidence, "making a difference", and wider reality role models than are traditionally found in books in many public libraries. There are also a small selection, not on the open shelves, which deal with complex issues children sometimes have to handle too early in their lives, such as drug or alcohol dependency, sexuality and death.

As one of the volunteer storytellers with the project describes: "up to 20 children aged between 6 and 12 gather on a rug on a Saturday morning to take part in stories. Drawn into stories and pictures they started many discussions of what they saw and understood and how this related to their lives. I told stories from all over the world, of peaceful warriors, fighting animals, of the lives of little girls and boys and of the wisdom of old men and women. We made drawings, musical shakers, masks, badges and paper flowers. We made stories into games, running up and down ladders of legs, and games into stories. We mimed animals at the Peace and Craft Fair. We made circles and a gateway to enter at the Mela and we often make thunderstorms with the percussive sounds of our hands. With children and storytellers from different parts of the world we have explored our cultures and creativity, we have learnt words in each others languages, talked about food, families and relational and environmental issues. The books are beautiful and the stories subtly or, more obviously weave peace themes and questions through them. It's great to be creating spaces where children and parents share in these stories."¹¹⁷

The Children's Mobile Peace Library is looking to extend its work by lending book boxes on themed issues to local primary schools. "This project reflects

¹¹⁴ Moore, P., (2006) *Personal email of reflections on the project* dated 19th November

¹¹⁵ Black and Minority Ethnic

¹¹⁶ Children's Mobile Peace Library final report (2006)

¹¹⁷ Mundy, L., (2006) *Personal email of reflections on the project* dated: 15th November.

the activist side of the Commonweal Collection's mission to be a resource for peace and social justice in Bradford and the United Kingdom"¹¹⁸

Treehouse (Bradford Centre for Nonviolence)

Treehouse is the home of the Bradford Centre for Nonviolence. The City of Bradford declared itself a City of Peace in 1997¹¹⁹ and has long been attempting to establish a city-wide Centre for Peace. After a succession of false starts, a group of Peace activists working under the title Bradford Centre for Nonviolence (now renamed Treehouse) finally made it happen. Treehouse has its roots in a Fair Trade Café which was established in 1994 near the University, and operated successfully for 12 years. In 2005 the Diocese of Bradford (who owned the building) wanted to change the use of the building. The café closed until a new agreement with the Diocese was reached.

Treehouse opened its doors in September 2006, housing a fair-trade and organic café, meeting space and the Children's Mobile Peace Library. The centre also houses a portion of the Commonweal Collection on long-term loan. Neither the centre nor the Commonweal wanted to undertake a wholesale move, and it was decided to split the collection between the more theoretical material and the more activist material. The more activist material was to be taken to Treehouse.

Because outreach from Commonweal and access to the collection has always been one of the areas in which Commonweal has worked, the chance to relocate part of the collection to a locus of activists seemed too good to miss! The part of the collection that has moved is that on "non-violent social action". The workgroup, under the guidance of one of the trustees identified the material on non-violent social action. The moved stock remains on the University Library catalogue (so it is easily searchable), and there will doubtless be issues related to the maintenance of the collection in a new venue with no dedicated staff (although the Treehouse Co-ordinator has responsibility for overseeing the collection as part of their role).

Where to from here?

The Commonweal Collection continues, possibly not in *exactly* the way imagined by David Hoggett, but through its new involvement in the Children's Mobile Peace Library and the Treehouse it is more accessible to the public than it has been for some time, and it definitely fulfils the stated aims when the collection was established: "to promote the study... [of] all matters relating to the progress and development of communities and of mankind

¹¹⁸ Arber, C., (2006) *Open Letter* in the Children's Mobile Peace Library final report

¹¹⁹ Rank, C. (ed.), (1997) p.24

generally and especially relating to the solving of conflict and the progress of mankind towards nonviolence"¹²⁰

The Commonweal is still dependent on donations of materials, and of time and money. More details about how you can donate materials, money, or your time can be found at <http://www.brad.ac.uk/library/services/commonweal/index.php>. There is also a Friends Scheme for regular donations.

References and further reading

Barlow, S., (1999) *The Commonweal Collection : the story of a library for a non-violent world* Bradford: Commonweal Collection.

Hoggett, D. (1996) *Travels of an International Voluntary Service worker : a series of newsletters written to personal friends* Bradford: Commonweal Collection

Rank, C., (eds.) (1997) *City for Peace : Bradford's story* Bradford: MCB. *Acknowledgements*

We are grateful to the trustees and volunteers of Commonweal Collection, Children's Mobile Peace Library and Treehouse for their assistance in compiling this article.

¹²⁰ Trust deed of the Commonweal Trust (1963), clause 1.